# Accepted Manuscript

Crab-meat-isolated psychrophilic spore forming bacteria inactivation by electron beam ionizing radiation

S. Condón-Abanto, S. Pedrós-Garrido, G. Cebrián, J. Raso, S. Condón, J.G. Lyng, I. Álvarez

PII: S0740-0020(17)30988-7

DOI: 10.1016/j.fm.2018.06.007

Reference: YFMIC 3028

To appear in: Food Microbiology

Received Date: 13 October 2017

Revised Date: 17 April 2018

Accepted Date: 11 June 2018

Please cite this article as: Condón-Abanto, S., Pedrós-Garrido, S., Cebrián, G., Raso, J., Condón, S., Lyng, J.G., Álvarez, I., Crab-meat-isolated psychrophilic spore forming bacteria inactivation by electron beam ionizing radiation, *Food Microbiology* (2018), doi: 10.1016/j.fm.2018.06.007.

This is a PDF file of an unedited manuscript that has been accepted for publication. As a service to our customers we are providing this early version of the manuscript. The manuscript will undergo copyediting, typesetting, and review of the resulting proof before it is published in its final form. Please note that during the production process errors may be discovered which could affect the content, and all legal disclaimers that apply to the journal pertain.



1	Title: Crab-meat-isolated psychrophilic spore forming bacteria inactivation by electron beam
2	ionizing radiation.
3	
4	Authors: Condón-Abanto, S. <sup>1,2</sup> , Pedrós-Garrido, S. <sup>1,3</sup> , Cebrián, G. <sup>1</sup> , <u>Raso, J.</u> <sup>1</sup> , Condón, S. <sup>1</sup> ,
5	Lyng, J.G. <sup>2</sup> and Álvarez, I. <sup>1</sup> *
6	
7	* Corresponding author: Ignacio Álvarez
8	<sup>1</sup> Grupo de Nuevas Tecnologías de Conservación de Alimentos, Facultad de Veterinaria,
9	Universidad de Zaragoza, C/ Miguel Servet 177, 50013, Zaragoza, Spain.
10	<sup>2</sup> UCD Institute of Food and Health, University College Dublin, Belfield Dublin 4 Ireland.
11	<sup>3</sup> School of Veterinary Medicine, University College Dublin, Belfield, Dublin 4, Ireland
12	TEL.: 0034 876 55 54 52
13	FAX: 0034 976 76 15 90
14	E-mail: nacho.alvarez@unizar.es
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	Keywords: Ionizing radiation; psychrophilic spore inactivation; seafood; Brown crab.

#### 25 Abstract

26 The present work was performed to evaluate the potential of electron beam ionizing radiation for the inactivation of three psychrophilic spore forming bacteria (Bacillus 27 mycoides, Bacillus weihenstephanensis and Psychrobacillus psychrodurans) isolated from 28 ready-to-eat brown crab (Cancer pagurus). Inactivation curves for the three spores were 29 performed in both types of crab meat, brown and white. Also the effect of pH and water 30 activity (a<sub>w</sub>) on the lethal efficacy of ionizing radiation, for the three different psychrophilic 31 spore forming bacteria, was evaluated. The effects of pH, a<sub>w</sub> and their possible interactions 32 were assessed in citrate-phosphate buffers of different pH, ranging between 7 and 4, and a<sub>w</sub>, 33 ranging from <0.99 and 0.80. A reduction of a<sub>w</sub> increased the spores resistance between 34 >0.99 and 0.90, while an  $a_w$  reduction from 0.90 to 0.80 had a minor impact on their 35 resistance. In contrast to a<sub>w</sub>, the effect of pH showed a greater variability depending on the 36 37 spore species. While pH did not affect the resistance of B. weihenstephanensis at any a<sub>w</sub>, B. mycoides showed slightly higher resistance at pH 5.5 at a<sub>w</sub> of 0.90 and 0.80. pH showed a 38 39 significant effect on the resistance of P. psychrodurans. For the two types of crab meat, slightly differences were observed in 6D values. <u>B. weihenstephanensis was</u> the most 40 resistant, requiring 7.3-7.6 kGy to inactivate 6 Log<sub>10</sub>-cycles of this spore forming bacterium, 41 while for B. mycoides and P. psychrodurans 6.1-6.3 and 5.4-5.3 kGy respectively were 42 necessary to reach the same inactivation level in crab meat. An agreement between spore 43 resistance in crab meats and lab media, with similar characteristics in pH and a<sub>w</sub>, was also 44 observed. The results obtained in this research demonstrated the potential for ionizing 45 radiation to achieve an appropriate inactivation level of spores naturally present in brown 46 crab with the application of doses lower than 10 kGy. 47

48

49 Keywords: Ionizing radiation; psychrophilic spore inactivation; seafood; Brown crab.

50

#### 51 **1. INTRODUCTION**

The use of ionizing radiation for food decontamination was proposed in the 19th 52 century, and since then a wide range of research has been performed to evaluate the potential 53 of this technology for microbial inactivation (De Lara et al., 2002; Grant and Patterson, 1992; 54 Jeong and Kang, 2017; Sarrías et al., 2003; Thayer and Boyd, 1993), and assess its influence 55 on food properties (Byun et al., 2000 and 2008; Diehl, 1991; Graham and Stevenson, 1997; 56 Lee et al., 2001). Currently, a number of organisations worldwide have accepted this 57 technology as a safe alternative technology for food decontamination (WHO, FDA). The 58 World Health Organization has established 10 kGy as the maximum dose for food processing 59 without any adverse effect on food matrixes (WHO 1981). Though, a later study concluded 60 that no limiting dose is required (WHO 1999). Either way, nowadays more than 60 countries 61 worldwide have regulations regarding the use of ionizing radiation for food products (IAEA, 62 2017). In fact, the joint FAO/IAEA (International Atomic Energy Agency) Division of 63 Nuclear Techniques in Food and Agriculture estimates that approximately 700,000 tonnes of 64 food were irradiated in 2013 (IAEA, 2015). The main potential for the use of ionizing 65 radiation in foods is its ability to extend the microbiological shelf-life with poultry, egg 66 products, red meats, seafood products and spices proposed as good candidates for the use of 67 radiation as decontamination technology, due to its potential to inactivate microorganisms at 68 low temperatures (Farkas, 2006). 69

Fish and fishery products have a special interest due to their particular characteristics. Many of these products are commercially cooked as products in their own right or are cooked for use as ingredients in ready-to-eat products, where a thermal pasteurization to reduce 6 Log<sub>10</sub>-cycles of non-proteolytic *Clostridium botulinum* type E is commonly applied to ensure food safety. However, the shelf-life of these products is directly dependent on the cold chain

during distribution, due to the presence of other more heat resistant psychrophilic. These microorganisms are able to survive conventional pasteurization treatments and germinate during <u>chilled</u> storage producing a noticeable reduction in the shelf-life of the product. A clear example of this issue is the preservation of ready-to-eat brown crab (*Cancer pagurus*).

Brown crab (Cancer pagurus) is one of the most consumed crustaceans in southern 79 European countries where the market has been dominated by the fresh live products 80 (Edwards & Early, 2001). However, the expansion of the market of this crustacean to the 81 United States of America and Japan, where the consumption of ready-to-eat products is 82 increasing (Edwrads & Early, 2001), makes it necessary to evaluate alternative technologies 83 for the production of safe products with high quality attributes and prolonged shelf-life. One 84 of the major problems in the production of ready-to-eat seafood products is the presence of 85 psychrophilic bacterial spores (Faghri et al., 1984; Gram and Huss, 1996) which show high 86 resistance against the thermal decontamination processes, requiring a severe heat treatment to 87 reduce their population up to an acceptable level, though these treatments can affect the 88 quality attributes of the final product. So, Electron Beam Ionizing radiation (EBI) could be an 89 alternative in their production. 90

It is widely recognised that microbial inactivation induced by ionizing radiation is due 91 to the DNA damage (Farkas, 2006). Despite the knowledge of its inactivation mechanism, a 92 lack of data exists concerning the effects of treatment media characteristics on the lethal 93 efficacy of EBI. It is also well known that physico-chemical characteristics of the treatment 94 medium have an important effect on the microbial resistance against physical stress; however 95 few studies in this respect related to EBI exists (Fan and Sommers, 2012; Huhtanen et al., 96 1989; Thayer and Boyd, 1993). To the best knowledge of the authors a systematic study to 97 assess the effect of common variables, such as pH, water activity (a<sub>w</sub>) and their interactions 98

- 99 <u>on the lethal effect of EBI has not been previously described</u>. This lack of knowledge <u>is</u> even
  100 larger in the case of psychrophilic bacterial spores.
- 101 The main objectives of the present study were to evaluate the potential application of ionizing
- 102 radiation to reduce the spore population present in crab meats, to assess the influence of the
- 103 pH and water activity of the treatment media on the lethal effect of EBI treatments on three
- 104 <u>different psychrophilic spores isolated from pasteurised crab (Cancer pagurus) and to analyse</u>
- 105 if the obtained inactivation results in lab media allows to predict the results obtained in the
- 106 <u>food matrix.</u>

107

108

## 2. MATERIALS AND METHODS

#### 109 2.1. Microorganisms, treatment media and sample preparation

The three spore forming bacteria used in this study were the three most isolated from 110 Irish brown crab (Cancer pagurus): Bacillus mycoides, Bacillus weihenstephanensis and 111 *Psychrobacillus psychrodurans*. During this investigation, the three spore suspensions were 112 managed and prepared as described by Condon-Abanto et al. (2016). In brief, 1 mL from a 113 pure culture in stationary phase was spread onto the surface of Tryptone Soya Agar with 114 0.6% (w/v) yeast extract (TSAYE) (Oxoid Ltd., Basingstoke, Hampshire, UK) agar plates 115 containing 3 ppm (w/v) of manganese sulphate (Carlo Erba, Milan, Italy) and incubated at 25 116 °C for 10 days. Spores were then collected with sterile pH 7.0 McIlvaine citrate-phosphate 117 buffer (Dawson et al., 1974) and washed and centrifuged three times. The final spore 118 suspensions were then submerged in boiling water for 1 minute in order to inactivate the 119 possible remaining population of vegetative cells and stored under refrigeration (4±1 °C) until 120 121 use. The presence of aggregates was evaluated by direct microscopic observation in a Thoma

To evaluate the effect of the different treatment media characteristics, such as pH and 124 water activity (a<sub>w</sub>), a series of McIlvaine citrate-phosphate buffers (Dawson et al., 1974) of 125 different pH and a<sub>w</sub> were prepared. pH was adjusted to 4.0, 5.5 and 7.0 using a pH meter 126 BASIC 20 (Crison Instrument, Barcelona, Spain) and then the a<sub>w</sub> was adjusted to 0.80, 0.90 127 and >0.99 by adding different proportions of glycerol with the  $a_w$  measured using a dew point 128 instrument (Water Activity System mod. CX-1, Decagon Devices, Pullman, WA, USA). 129 Once all treatment media were prepared, they were sterilized at 121 °C for 20 min and stored 130 under refrigeration  $(4\pm1 \text{ }^{\circ}\text{C})$  until required for use. 131

Immediately before treatments, the different media were distributed in 24-well plates. Each well was filled with 2 mL of buffer of a certain pH and a<sub>w</sub> under aseptic conditions in a sterile laminar flow cabinet (Telestar mini-V/PCR, Telestar Technologies, S.L., Terrasa, Spain). Then, plates were inoculated by adding 0.1 mL of the corresponding dilution of each spore suspension, in order to reach an initial count of approximately 10<sup>5</sup> spores/mL in each well. The inoculated well plates were immediately treated. <u>The pH and water activity of the</u> treatment media did not differ before and after EBI treatments.

For crab meat samples, crabs were cooked at 95 °C for 20 minutes. White meat from claws and brown meat from the body were then removed aseptically in a sterile laminar flow cabinet (Telestar mini-V/PCR, Telestar Technologies, S.L., Terrasa, Spain) to ensure the natural contamination was under the detection limit (data not shown). Then, meats were distributed by placing 1 g of each meat in sterile tubes of 10 mL, and 0.1 mL of the corresponding spore suspension dilution was added obtaining an initial concentration of 10<sup>6</sup> spores/g. The inoculated meat was manually mixed with a sterile spoon to uniformly

distribute the spores in the meat, and treated immediately. a<sub>w</sub> of the crab meat, both white and
brown was 0.99 and the pH ranged from 7.5-8.0.

148

#### 149 2.2. Irradiation treatments

Irradiation treatments were carried out in a 10-MeV circular electron accelerator 150 (Rhodotron) at the irradiation plant of Ionisos Ibérica (Tarancón, Cuenca, Spain). Well plates, 151 and inoculated meat samples were irradiated at programmed doses of 1, 2, 5, 10 and 15 kGy. 152 Irradiation dosimetry was carried out by using a band of cellulose triacetate located on the 153 surface of the samples (Nieto-Sandoval et al., 2000). The irradiation dosimetry indicated that 154 the actual doses applied were 1.13, 2.07, 5.38, 10.7 and 16.4 kGy, respectively. All 155 experiments were carried out in triplicate, by using different independently prepared spore 156 suspensions, applying irradiation doses in different runs during the same working day due to 157 limit accessibility to the circular electron accelerator. 158

159

## 160 2.3. Recovery, incubation and survival counting of treated samples

Immediately after treatments serial decimal dilutions in MRD of liquid samples were 161 pour-plated using TSAYE (Oxoid) as recovery media. Meat samples were diluted in 9 mL of 162 maximum recovery diluent (MRD) (Oxoid) and homogenized with an ultra-turrax<sup>®</sup> for 20 163 seconds. Then, proper dilutions in MRD were pour-plated in TSAYE (Oxoid). Plates were 164 incubated at 25 °C for 24 hours for *B. mycoides* and *B. weihenstephanensis* and 48 hours for 165 P. psychrodurans. Longer incubation times did not change the obtained counts (data not 166 shown). Colony-forming units (CFU) were counted with an improved automatic colony-167 counting image analyzer (Protos, Synoptics, Cambridge, UK), previously described by 168 Condón et al. (1987). 169

#### 171 2.4. Modeling and Statistical analysis

Survival curves obtained from the electron beam irradiation treatments were obtained 172 by plotting the Log<sub>10</sub> fraction of survivors vs. the applied dose (kGy). Under most 173 experimental conditions deviations from linearity were observed, determining survival curves 174 with concave downwards profiles (shoulder). Because of this shape the Geeraerd et al. log-175 linear regression plus shoulder model was used (Geeraerd et al., 2000) to fit the survival 176 curves, but swapping the parameter of time in the original model with the applied dose in 177 kGy. Survival curves were fitted to the model by approach of least squares (i.e. by reducing 178 the sum of square errors, between real and predicted values, to the minimum) using GraphPad 179 PRISM® 5.0 software (GraphPad software, Inc., San Diego, CA, USA). The model includes 180 two parameters to describe the survival curves (Equation 1): shoulder length (Sl) which 181 182 defines the applied dose before the exponential inactivation begins, and the inactivation rate  $(k_{\text{max}})$  that corresponds to the slope of the exponential portion of the survival curve. 183

184 
$$N_{\rm t} = N_0 e^{-k_{\rm max}*dose} \left(\frac{e^{k_{\rm max}Sl}}{1 + (e^{-k_{\rm max}Sl} - 1)e^{k_{\rm max}*dose}}\right) \tag{1}$$

Based in  $k_{max}$  the traditional decimal reduction value ( $\underline{D}_{10}$ ) of each survival curve was calculated (Equation 2). In this case, the  $\underline{D}_{10}$  value corresponds to the necessary dose (kGy) to produce a 90% reduction in the spore population.

188 
$$D_{10} = 2.303/k_{\rm max}$$
 (2)

To determine the treatment parameters and compare the resistance between the three spores under study, <u>6D</u> values were calculated. In this case <u>6D</u> is defined as the necessary dose to inactivate  $6 \text{ Log}_{10}$ -cycles of the initial spore population, and is calculated by Equation 3.

193  $6D = Sl + 6*D_{10}$  (3)

194 Where *Sl* is the shoulder length duration and  $\underline{D}_{10}$  is the inactivation parameter 195 calculated from Equation 2.

- 196  $R^2$  and *RMSE* values provided by the software were used to evaluate the goodness of 197 fits. Statistical analyses (*t*-test and one-way ANOVA) were performed with the GraphPad 198 PRISM<sup>®</sup> and differences were considered significant if  $p \le 0.05$ . The standard deviations (*SD*) 199 are given in the figures as the error bars.
- 200
- **3. RESULTS**
- 3.1. Spore inactivation kinetics by electron beam irradiation: Effect of pH and water
  activity (a<sub>w</sub>).

Figure 1(A-C) shows, as examples, the inactivation curves obtained in citrate-204 phosphate buffer at pH 7.0 at three different a<sub>w</sub> for *B. mycoides* (A), *B. weihenstephanensis* 205 (B) and P. psychrodurans (C) (inactivation curves at pH 5.5 and pH 4 are shown in 206 supplementary material as Figure S1A-C and S2A-C respectively). As observed, inactivation 207 208 increased with increasing irradiation dose. For the three spores under study, concave downwards profiles were generally observed at neutral pH in all water activities. The profile 209 of some inactivation curves at other pHs (i.e. 4.0 and 5.5) did not showed shoulders. As 210 indicated in the Materials and Methods section, Geeraerd et al. log-linear regression plus 211 shoulder model (Geeraerd et al., 2000) was used to fit the inactivation curves and to calculate 212 the resistance parameters shoulder length (Sl), and decimal reduction doses ( $D_{10}$ ). Figure 1 213 also presents the line obtained from modelling (black line) to show the goodness of fit. 214 Model parameters are shown in Table 1 as well the root mean square error (RMSE). In all 215 cases the obtained  $R^2$  values were >0.99. 216

For the three spore species,  $a_w$  affected their irradiation resistance influencing both, the *Sl* and the  $D_{10}$  values. The maximum resistance was observed at the lowest investigated  $a_w$  (0.80), whereas pH hardly affected the irradiation resistance. The *Sl* of *B. mycoides*, ranged between 0 and 0.6 kGy and  $D_{10}$  values ranged from 0.8 to 2.1 kGy, showing the

highest  $\underline{D}_{10}$  of the three bacterial species investigated. As in *Sl*, the pH hardly changed the  $\underline{D}_{10}$ values, while the reduction of  $a_w$  showed an important influence. The reduction of  $a_w$  from >0.99 to 0.90 induced an increase in the  $\underline{D}_{10}$  values, close to a 2-fold order of magnitude, while further reductions hardly changed this parameter.

In the case of B. weihenstephanensis, the Sl ranged from 1.1 and 2.5 kGy, being the 225 species which showed the longest Sl. When  $a_w$  was reduced from >0.99 to 0.90 it induced 226 increases of 72%, 90% and 66% in the Sl at pH 7.0, 5.5 and 4.0, respectively, while the 227 reduction from 0.90 to 0.80 only increased the Sl by 26%, 19% and 17%, respectively, at the 228 229 same pHs. On the other hand,  $\underline{D}_{10}$  values ranged from 0.8 to 1.6 kGy, and were scarcely affected by pH at any aw. And, as in B. mycoides, the reduction of aw increased irradiation 230 resistance. In this case, a  $\underline{a}_w$  variation from >0.99 to 0.90 supposed increases of 77%, 67% 231 and 100% at pH 7.0, 5.5 and 4.0, respectively, on the  $D_{10}$  values. However, further  $a_w$ 232 reductions hardly change this parameter at any pH. 233

Finally, P. psychrodurans showed a similar behaviour in terms of the effect of a<sub>w</sub> on 234 Sl values to B. weihenstephanensis with a reduction in  $a_w$  leading to an increase in the Sl. 235 However, the influence of pH was more noticeable. At pH 5.5 and 4.0, Sl values drastically 236 increased when  $a_w$  of the treatment medium was reduced from >0.99 to 0.90, although further 237 reductions scarcely produced any change in this parameter. Surprisingly, the same reductions 238 in a<sub>w</sub> at neutral pH slightly affected the Sl values, showing the lowest values compared to 239 240 other pHs. On the other hand,  $\underline{D}_{10}$  values ranged from 0.7 to 1.9 kGy varying with both  $a_w$ and pH. Similarly to the other investigated spores,  $\underline{D}_{10}$  values of *P. psychrodurans* increased 241 when a<sub>w</sub> was reduced but its irradiation resistance was higher at neutral pH. 242

In summary, the inactivation curves obtained for the evaluated spore forming bacteria showed a great variability <u>with regard</u> to the shoulder length duration. Also pH and  $a_w$  effects varied notably respect to the studied species: in <u>*B. weihenstephanensis*</u> both factors seemed to

be independent <u>of</u> each other, but for *P. psychrodurans* an interaction between these two factors was observed. The differences detected in  $\underline{D}_{10}$  values between species and also the effects of pH and  $a_w$  were smaller than those detected in the *Sl* parameter. The most noticeable difference was observed in case of *P. psychrodurans* where a reduction in resistance was detected at acid pHs.

To define the irradiation treatment intensity required to apply at industrial level, both 251 Sl and  $\underline{D}_{10}$  values should be taken into account. To evaluate more clearly the effect of pH and 252 aw on the irradiation resistance of the investigated spores, 6D values were compared. The 253 254 advantage of using this value is that it comprises both inactivation model parameters, Sl and  $\underline{D}_{10}$ . Therefore, it is possible to compare directly the resistance between spores at all 255 investigated conditions. In addition, <u>6D</u> is the inactivation level of the target microorganism 256 257 to ensure the safety in processed ready-to-eat seafood products (FDA, 2011). Figure 2 shows the effect of a<sub>w</sub> and pH on the 6D values for B. mycoides (A), B. weihenstephanensis (B) and 258 P. psychrodurans (C). As observed, pH had a lower effect on the spore resistance than the 259 effect observed for a<sub>w</sub> For *P. psychrodurans* (Figure 2C), the highest resistance was observed 260 at neutral pH regardless the  $a_w$ , while at the other pHs no differences in resistance were 261 detected at a<sub>w</sub> of 0.90 and 0.80. Regarding *B. mycoides* the major difference between pHs was 262 detected at a<sub>w</sub> of 0.90 where a slightly higher resistance at pH 5.5 was observed (Fig. 2A). 263

In general, the maximum increase in the spore resistance was observed with  $a_w$ reduction from >0.99 to 0.90, while further reductions of  $a_w$  hardly affected the spore resistance. Only in the case of *P. psychrodurans* at pH 5.5, 6*D* value increased linearly from 5.9 kGy to 9.1 kGy with the  $a_w$  reductions. This species was also the most affected by the variation of  $a_w$ , increasing 6*D* values from 4.1 kGy to 8.5 kGy at pH 4 and from 5.8 to 11.7 at pH 7 when reducing  $a_w$  from >0.99 to 0.80.

270 From Figure 2, besides the influence of pH and a<sub>w</sub>, differences in radiation resistances between species can be observed. B. mycoides showed the lowest resistance (5.5 kGy) in pH 271 7.0 and a<sub>w</sub> of >0.99, and the highest (12.6 kGy) at pH 5.5 and 0.80 of a<sub>w</sub>. <u>B.</u> 272 weihenstephanensis showed the lowest resistance (6.2 kGy) at >0.99 of a<sub>w</sub> and pH 4, and the 273 highest (11.0-11.1 kGy) at all pH and both a<sub>w</sub> 0.90 and 0.80. P. psychrodurans showed the 274 lowest resistance (4.2 kGy) at pH 4.0 and  $a_w > 0.99$ , while the highest resistance (11.7 kGy) 275 was detected in media of pH 7.0 and a<sub>w</sub> of 0.80. B. weihenstephanensis showed the greatest 276 resistance at most pHs and water activities investigated. Only at the lowest  $a_w$  tested (0.80) 277 did B. mycoides became the most resistant spore at pH 5.5. Therefore choice of irradiation 278 reference organism is dependent upon  $a_w$  of the product. 279

280

#### 281 *3.2. Spores inactivation in crab meats*

As occurred in lab media, the inactivation curves obtained in crab meat showed 282 downwards profiles in all cases (Figures 3A and 3B). Therefore, the Geeraerd log-linear 283 regression plus shoulder model (Geeraerd et al., 2000) was used to describe the curves. Table 284 2 shows the resistance parameters for the three spores in white and brown meat:  $D_{10}$ , Sl and 285 6D values.  $R^2$  and RMSE have been included to show the goodness of fit of Equation 2 to the 286 survival curves. A slight increase of the radiation resistance parameters Sl,  $D_{10}$  and 6D was 287 observed when spores were treated in crab brown meat. B. weihenstephanensis was the most 288 289 resistant requiring 7.3 and 7.6 kGy for white and brown meat, respectively, to reach 6 Log<sub>10</sub>reductions, while P. psychrodurans was the most sensitive requiring 5.4 and 5.3 kGy, 290 respectively, to reach a similar inactivation level. 291

Figure <u>4 allows</u> the comparison among the resistances of the three bacterial spores to different food preservation technologies: heat, <u>ultrasonic waves under pressure at sublethal</u> temperatures (manosonication; MS) (Álvarez et al., 2003) and at lethal temperatures

(manothermosonication; MTS) (Arroyo et al., 2011), and EBI. Data for heat, MS and MTS
were extracted from Condón-Abanto et al. (2016). As observed, the maximum differences in
resistance between the most and lowest resistant spores were 1.7-fold for MS, 4.4-fold for
MTS, 44.4-fold for heat and less than 1.2-fold for EBI.

299

#### 300 **4. DISCUSSION**

Electron beam ionizing radiation appears to be one of the few non-thermal 301 technologies with the capability to inactivate spores in an effective way without requiring a 302 303 combination with other technologies such as heat, a phenomenon noted with other nonthermal technologies (Bermúdez-Aguirre et al., 2012; Cléry-Barraud et al., 2004; Condón-304 Abanto et al., 2016; Sevenich et al., 2015; Uemura and Isobe, 2003). Most published data 305 shows that spores are more resistant than vegetative cells with  $\underline{D}_{10}$  values in the range of 1-4 306 kGy, (De Lara et al., 2002; Farkas 2006). The  $\underline{D}_{10}$  values obtained in the present work at an 307  $a_w$  of >0.99, independent of the pH, ranged from 0.8 to 1.1 kGy. These <u>D</u><sub>10</sub> values were lower 308 than those observed in other *Bacillus* species, which showed  $\underline{D}_{10}$  values higher than 2 kGy 309 (De Lara et al., 2002; Sarrías et al., 2003; Valero et al., 2006), but when different aw were 310 considered,  $\underline{D}_{10}$  values ranged from 0.8 to 2.1 kGy. 311

According to our results, all the studied spores showed inactivation curves with no 312 exponential kinetics, and in most of the investigated conditions shoulders were observed. 313 314 Similar kinetics were described by other authors for *Bacillus* spores (Blatchley et al., 2005). However, log linear inactivation kinetics have also been described for B. cereus and B. 315 subtilis spores (De Lara et al., 2002). The presence of shoulders has been explained by the 316 capacity of microorganisms to repair damage caused by low intensity treatments, the 317 activation of dormant spores and due to the presence of agglomerates (Mathys et al., 2007; 318 Sapru et al., 1993). The microscopic observation of our suspensions did not show the 319

320 presence of aggregates and the presence of tails was not detected in any of the survival curves obtained, which allows discarding that the shoulders observed are produced due to the 321 presence of aggregates. On the other hand, the comparison of the microscopic counts with the 322 plate counts allowed to conclude that the presence of superdormant spores would represent 323 less than 10% of the population, which would indicate that the shoulders are not related to 324 activation phenomena either. On the other side, the repair of damages inflicted by 325 technological treatments has some special characteristics in bacterial spores since they can 326 only occur once germination has begun (Setlow, 2006). A detailed study on the damage 327 inflicted by radiation on the spores of *B. subtilis* were performed by Moeller et al. (2014). 328

Condón-Abanto et al. (2016) reported the presence of shoulders in the inactivation 329 curves when applying heat, manosonication (MS) and manothermosonication (MTS) 330 treatments, for *B. weihenstephanensis* and *P. pshychrodurans*, but not for *B. mycoides*. These 331 results suggested that the capacity of damage repair would depend on both the bacterial 332 species and the main target of the applied technology in terms of mechanism of action. 333 Considering that the main mechanism involved in the microbial inactivation produced by EBI 334 is the damage on the DNA, and the fact that the presence of shoulders is common in the 335 inactivation curves obtained with other technologies which act on the same target, such as the 336 case of UV-C light (Gayán et al., 2013), it is not surprising the detection of these shoulders in 337 the inactivation curves obtained in our research. 338

However, it has been postulated that pH and a<sub>w</sub> do not affect the antimicrobial effect of UV-C light (Gayán et al., 2014), while our results suggest that the pH and more significantly a<sub>w</sub> of the treatment medium affects the irradiation resistance. This fact would be related to the mechanism of action by which each radiation technology, UV-C or e-beam, affects DNA. While UV-C radiation induces the formation of photoproducts due to the direct absorption of photons (Gayán et al., 2014, Lopez-malo & Palou 2005), EBI reacts through

two mechanisms affecting the DNA. The most simple would be comparable with the UV-C 345 mechanisms where the damage in the DNA is produced when an energy photon or electron 346 crash randomly with the genetic material (Dickson 2001; Goodhead 1994; Yokoya et al., 347 2008); while the second one involved more complex reactions based on the radiation 348 chemistry of water. EBI, in presence of water, produces reactive species, from which 349 hydroxyl radicals (OH $\cdot$ ) and hydrogen peroxide (H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>) are considered the main factors 350 responsible for the reactions with nucleic acids (Sutherland et al., 2000; Lomax et al., 2002). 351 The protective effect of a<sub>w</sub> observed in this investigation shows the importance of this second 352 mechanism for the inactivation efficacy of EBI. These series of reactions would also explain 353 the results obtained by other authors, where the radiation resistance of different 354 microorganisms increased when microorganism were treated in frozen media, where again a<sub>w</sub> 355 356 is reduced by the freezing process (Black and Jaczynski, 2006; Fan and Sommers, 2012; Thayer and Boyd, 1993 and 2001). 357

De Lara et al. (2000) suggested that the mechanism involved in bacterial spore 358 inactivation by ionizing radiation would be very different from the mechanisms involved in 359 heat destruction due to the different targets of each technology. However, since research 360 about the effect of a<sub>w</sub> on spore resistance against EBI has not been described yet, it would be 361 convenient to compare the effect of this parameter between these two technologies. 362 Thermobacteriology studies with different *Bacillus* species have reported a linear correlation 363 between the Log of thermal  $\underline{D}_{10}$  values and (1-a<sub>w</sub>) in different ranges of a<sub>w</sub> (Guillard et al., 364 1998; Mazas et al., 1999), but in the present study no clear relations were detected between 365 these two parameters. Mazas et al. (1999) reported that the effect of a<sub>w</sub> on the heat resistance 366 of several strains of *Bacillus cereus* spores begins to be noticed at a<sub>w</sub> values lower than 0.85, 367 while our results suggest that the main effect of a<sub>w</sub> on the radiation lethal efficacy is produced 368 between  $a_w$  values from >0.99 to 0.90. Additionally, they reported that a decrease in  $a_w$  from 369

370 0.96 to 0.71 increased  $\underline{D}_{10}$  values to heat between 30 and 60-fold and Gillard et al. (1998) observed an increase on  $\underline{D}_{10}$  values to heat (of *B. cereus*) higher than ten-fold when the  $a_w$ 371 was reduced from >0.99 to 0.80. Contrarily, our results showed a much lower protective 372 effect of low a<sub>w</sub>, since the resistance of spores hardly increased when a<sub>w</sub> was reduced from 373 0.90 to 0.80. The protective effect of a<sub>w</sub> reduction against EBI is related presumably with the 374 indirect inactivation mechanisms based on the formation of oxidative species (ROS) due to 375 the radiation chemistry of water but also due to a reduction of the intercellular water content 376 of the spore (Dickson, 2001; Moeller at al., 2014). The sorption isotherm of the most organic 377 materials indicates that, the reduction of  $a_w$  from >0.99 to 0.9 involves a great percentage 378 reduction of the water content, while a<sub>w</sub> reduction from 0.90 to 0.80 requires a much smaller 379 reduction of the water content (Yanniotis and Blahovec, 2009). This would explain the great 380 protective effect of  $a_w$  between >0.99 and 0.90 and the low protective effect between 0.90 and 381 0.80 observed in this research. 382

To date, as in the case of a<sub>w</sub>, no data about the effect of pH on EBI lethal efficacy, are 383 available in the literature in order to discuss with those obtained in the present work. 384 However, the effect of pH on the heat resistance of bacterial spores has been widely 385 described (Casadei et al., 2001; Palop et al., 1996 and 1999). While the pH hardly affected to 386 spore inactivation by EBI, it is reported that the heat resistance of B. licheniformis and B. 387 cereus changed 20 and 3-fold respectively when the pH was reduced from 7 to 4 (Palop et al. 388 1996 and 1999). Mazas et al. (1999) and Casadei et al. (2001) also reported reductions of 5 389 and 7-fold in the heat resistance of B. cereus for similar reduction of pH on the treatment 390 media. All of these discrepancies support the hypothesis that very different mechanisms are 391 involved in the bacterial spore inactivation by heat and EBI. Although, the few effects of pH 392 on spore resistances with EBI treatments is similar to those observed on UV-C light, which 393 produce the microbial inactivation through similar mechanisms. 394

395 Another important difference which showed the distinct inactivation mechanisms for each technology is the resistance variability between species. Figure 4 shows a comparison 396 among the three investigated bacterial spores against heat, MS, MTS and EBI. The variability 397 398 in resistance among spores was different depending on the inactivation technology. The maximum differences in resistance among the three spores were 1.7-fold for MS, 4.4-fold for 399 MTS, 44.4-fold for heat and less than 1.2-fold in the case of EBI. These differences in 400 resistance between species would be attributable to the different targets of each technology. 401 As it has been already pointed out, while cell envelopes are the main target for ultrasound 402 (Condón et al., 2011), the most sensitive targets in heat inactivation of bacterial spores seems 403 to be DNA, core enzymes or spore membranes (Palop et al. 1998; Setlow, 1995). On the 404 other hand, as was suggested previously, the most sensitive target to ionizing radiation is the 405 DNA which would explain the small differences in resistance between species as it has been 406 previously suggested for other technologies which act on the same targets such as UV-C 407 (Gaván et al., 2013). 408

In general, the obtained results in this research could involve important practical implications. While changes in the contaminating flora, pH or a<sub>w</sub> could increase the risk of microbial survival thousands of times in a sterilised product by heat, the same variables would hardly affect the safety and stability of a sterilised product by ionizing radiation.

It has been reported that a radiation dose  $\leq 2$  kGy produced a significant extension of the shelf-life of different crab products (Chen et al., 1996; ICGFI, 1998). However, to the best of our knowledge, no studies assessing the radiation resistance of naturally present bacterial spores in crab products have been reported in the form presented in the present work. The obtained results showed that, similar to observations in lab media, the inactivation kinetics of the three spore species showed a shoulder followed by an exponential decay, as it has been reported for other *Bacillus* species in different media (Blatchley et al., 2005). Our

420 results also proved that, despite the different composition and chemical characteristics of the two kinds of crab meat (Anacleto et al., 2011; Barrento et al., 2010), the specific resistance of 421 each spore was scarcely affected by the type of meat. Moreover, the specific resistances of 422 each species in meat were similar to those detected in lab media at similar pH and a<sub>w</sub> levels. 423 These results would indicate that unlike other technologies, the irradiation dose applied to lab 424 media could be used as reference to calculate the necessary treatments for each specific 425 foodstuff. Nevertheless, this important aspect would require further more exhaustive studies. 426 Finally, the inactivation curves obtained in both types of meats suggested that a dose below 427 10 kGy, which is the maximum permitted and recommended legal dose by FAO/WHO for 428 foods, would permit a reduction of 6  $Log_{10}$ -cycles of any of the investigated bacterial spores 429 present in crab and crab products. These results would indicate that EBI could be an adequate 430 technology to preserve brown crab. However, further research would be necessary to 431 determine the impact of those treatments in the crab meat quality and the maximum 432 applicable dose to avoid possible undesirable changes on the sensory characteristics. 433

- 434
- 435 **5. CONCLUSIONS**

In summary, this work covers a knowledge gap in the field of bacterial spore 436 inactivation by electron beam ionizing radiation. The obtained results showed that the pH of 437 the treatment media could affect the spore resistance, although the effect would be dependent 438 on the specific spore under study. On the other hand, an important protective effect of low a<sub>w</sub> 439 of the treatment medium was observed, but the impact of this parameter is present in a larger 440 or smaller magnitude depending on the bacterial spore. The protective effect of the reduction 441 on  $a_w$  has the major effect in the range from >0.99 to 0.90, regardless the investigated spore. 442 The studied spores showed, in both lab media and crab meat, shoulders followed by an 443 exponential decay profiles in their inactivation kinetics. Crab meat type and its composition 444

445 <u>hardly affected the specific resistance of each spore.</u> The observed radiation resistances in 446 meats were comparable with the resistances determined in lab media of similar pH and  $a_w$ .

#### 447 Acknowledgements

The authors wish to acknowledge the financial support of the Food Institutional Research
Measure (FIRM) funded by the Irish Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine
(Project no. 13F529). And to the European Regional Development Fund, MINECO-CICYT
(AGL2015-69565-P) and the Department of Innovation Research and University of the
Aragon Government and European Social Fund (ESF).

453

#### 455 **References**

- 456 Álvarez, I., Mañas, P., Sala, F., Condón, S., 2003. Inactivation of *Salmonella* enterica serovar
- 457 <u>Enteritidis by ultrasonic waves under pressure at different water activities. Appl.</u>
- 458 <u>Environ. Microbiol. 69, 668-672.</u>
- 459 Anacleto, P., Teixeira, B., Marques, P., Pedro, S., Nunes, M.L., Marques, A., 2011. Shelf-life
- 460 of cooked edible crab (*Cancer pagurus*) stored under refrigerated conditions. <u>LWT -</u>
  461 <u>Food Sci. Technol.</u> 44, 1376-1382.
- 462 Arroyo, C., Cebrián, G., Pagán, R., Condón, S., 2011. Inactivation of Cronobacter sakazakii
- 463 by manothermosonication in buffer and milk. Int. J. Food Microbiol. 151, 21-28.
- Barrento, S., Marques, A., Teixeira, B., Mendes, R., Bandarra, N., Vaz-Pires, P., Nunes,
  M.L., 2010. Chemical composition, cholesterol, fatty acid and amino acid in two
  populations of brown crab *Cancer pagurus*: Ecological and human health implications. J.
  Food Comp. Anal. 23, 716-725.
- Bermúdez-Aguirre, D., Dunne, C.P., Barbosa-Cánovas, G.V., 2012. Effect of processing
  parameters on inactivation of *Bacillus cereus* spores in milk using pulsed electric fields.
  Int. Dairy J. 24, 13-21.
- 471 Black, J.L., Jaczynski, J., 2006. Temperature Effect on Inactivation Kinetics of Escherichia
- 472 *coli O157:H7* by Electron Beam in Ground Beef, Chicken Breast Meat, and Trout Fillets.
- 473 J. Food Sci. 71, M221-M227.
- Blatchley, E.R., Meeusen, A., Aronson, A.I., Brewster, L., 2005. Inactivation of *Bacillus*Spores by Ultraviolet or Gamma Radiation. J. Environ. Eng. 131, 1245-1252.
- 476 Byun, E.H., Kim, J.H., Sung, N.Y., Choi, J.i., Lim, S.T., Kim, K.H., Yook, H.S., Byun,
- M.W., Lee, J.W., 2008. Effects of gamma irradiation on the physical and structural
  properties of β-glucan. Radiat. Phys. Chem. 77, 781-786.

- Byun, M.W., Lee, K.H., Kim, D.H., Kim, J.H., Yook, H.S., Ahn, H.J., 2000. Effects of
  Gamma Radiation on Sensory Qualities, Microbiological and Chemical Properties of
- 481 Salted and Fermented Squid. J. Food Prot. 63, 934-939.
- 482 Casadei, M.A., Ingram, R., Hitchings, E., Archer, J., Gaze, J.E., 2001. Heat resistance of
  483 Bacillus cereus, Salmonella typhimurium and Lactobacillus delbrueckii in relation to pH
- and ethanol. Int. J. Food Microbiol. 63, 125-134.
- Cléry-Barraud, C., Gaubert, A., Masson, P., Vidal, D., 2004. Combined Effects of High
  Hydrostatic Pressure and Temperature for Inactivation of *Bacillus anthracis* Spores.
  Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 70, 635-637.
- 488 Codex Alimentarius Commission, 1984. Codex general standards for irradiated foods and
- 489 recommended international code of practice for the operation of radiation facilities used
- 490 for the treatment of foods, CAC, Vol. XV, E-1, Food and Agriculture Organization of the491 united nations, Rome.
- 492 Condón, S., Manas, P., Cebrian, G., 2011. Manothermosonication for microbial inactivation.
- In: Feng, H., Barbosa-Canovas, G.V., Weiss, J. (Eds), Ultrasound technologies for food
  bioprocessing. Springer, New York, pp. 287-319.
- Condón, S., Oria, R. and Sala, F.J. 1987, Heat resistance of microorganisms: an improved
  method for survival counting. J. Microbiol Methods, 7:37-44.
- 497 Condón, S., Palop, A., Raso, J. and Sala, F.J., 1996. Influence of the incubation temperature
  498 after heat treatment upon the estimated heat resistance values of spores of *Bacillus*499 *subtilis*. Lett. Appl. Microbiol. 22: 149–152.
- 500 Condón-Abanto, S., Arroyo, C., Álvarez, I., Condón, S., Lyng, J.G., 2016. Application of 501 ultrasound in combination with heat and pressure for the inactivation of spore forming
- 502 bacteria isolated from edible crab (*Cancer pagurus*). Int. J. Food Microbiol. 223, 9-16.

- 503 Chen, Y.P., Andrews, L.S. and Grodner, R.M., 1996. Sensory and Microbial Quality of
  504 Irradiated Crab Meat Products. J. Food Sci. 61: 1239–1242.
- 505 Dawson, R.M.C., D. C. Elliot, W. H. Elliot, and K. M. Jones, 1974. pH, buffers and
- 506 phisiological media Dawson, R. M. C., D. C. Elliot, W. H. Elliot, and K. M. Jones (Eds.),
- 507 data for biochemical research 2nd ed. Clarendon Press, Oxford, pp. 484-485,
- 508 De Lara, J., Fernández, P.S., Periago, P.M., Palop, A., 2002. Irradiation of spores of Bacillus
- *cereus* and *Bacillus subtilis* with electron beams. Innov. Food Sci. & Emerg. Technol. 3,
  379-384.
- 511 Dickson, James S., 2001. Radiation inactivation of microorganisms in: Ricardo A. Molins.
- 512 (Ed), Food Irradiation. Principles and Applications. 1<sup>st</sup> ed. Acribia, Zaragoza, Spain, pp.
  513 21-33.
- 514 Diehl, J.F., 1991. Nutritional effects of combining irradiation with other treatments. Food
  515 Control 2, 20-25.
- Edwards, E. & Early, J.C., 2001. Catching, handling and processing crabs. Torry advisory
  note No. 26, Minitry of technology, Torry research station, Her majesty's stationery
  office.
- Faghri, M.A., Pennington, C.L., Cronholm, L.S., Atlas, R.M., 1984. Bacteria associated with
  crabs from cold waters with emphasis on the occurrence of potential human pathogens.
- 521 Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 47, 1054-1061.
- Fan, Xuetong and Sommers, Christopher H., 2012. Food Irradiation Research and
  Technology, second ed. Wiley-Blackwell, New Jersey.
- 524 Farkas, J., 2006. Irradiation for better foods. Trends Food Sci. Technol. 17, 148-152.
- 525 FDA, 2011. Fish and Fishery Products Hazards and Controls Guidance, fourth ed. Technical
- 526 Report U.S .Department of Health and Human Services.

- Gaillard, S., Leguerinel, I. and Mafart, P., 1998. Model for Combined Effects of
  Temperature, pH and Water Activity on Thermal Inactivation of *Bacillus cereus* Spores.
  J. Food Sci. 63: 887–889.
- Gayán, E., Álvarez, I., Condón, S., 2013. Inactivation of bacterial spores by UV-C light.
  Innov. Food Sci. & Emerg. Technol. 19, 140-145.
- Gayán, E., Condón, S., Álvarez, I., 2014. Biological aspects in food preservation by
  ultraviolet light: A review. Food Bioproc. Technol. 7, 1-20
- 534 Geeraerd, A.H., Herremans, C.H., Van Impe, J.F., 2000. Structural model requirements to
- describe microbial inactivation during a mild heat treatment. Int. J. Food Microbiol. 59,185-209.
- 537 <u>Goodhead D.T., 1994. Initial events in the cellular effects of ionizing raditions: clustered</u>
  538 damage in DNA. Int. J. Radiat. Biol. 65:7-17.
- Graham, W. D. and Stevenson, M. H., 1997. Effect of irradiation on vitamin C content of
  strawberries and potatoes in combination with storage and with further cooking in
  potatoes. J. Sci. Food Agric., 75: 371–377.
- Gram, L., Huss, H.H., 1996. Microbiological spoilage of fish and fish products. Int. J. Food
  Microbiol 33, 121-137.
- Grant, I.R., Patterson, M.F., 1992. Sensitivity of foodborne pathogens to irradiation in the
  components of a chilled ready meal. Food Microbiol. 9, 95-103.
- Huhtanen, C.N., Jenkins, R.K., Thayer, D.W., 1989. Gamma Radiation Sensitivity of *Listeria monocytogenes*. J. Food Prot. 52, 610-613.
- 548 IAEA, 2015. Manual of good practice in food irradiation: Sanitary, Phytosanitary and other
- <sup>549</sup> applications. Technical Reports Series No481. International Atomic Energy Agency.
- 550 IAEA, 2017. https://www.iaea.org/topics/food-irradiation. Consulted May 2017.

- 551 ICGFI 1998, Monograph on irradiation of fish, shellfish and frog legs, International
  552 Consultative Group on Food Irradiation, International Atomic Agency, Vienna.
- Jeong, S.G., Kang, D.H., 2017. Inactivation of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7, *Salmonella Typhimurium*, and *Listeria monocytogenes* in ready-to-bake cookie dough by gamma and
  electron beam irradiation. Food Microbiol. 64, 172-178.
- 556 Lee, J.W., Kim, J.H., Yook, H.S., Kang, K.O., Lee, S.Y., Hwang, H.J., Byun, M.W., 2001.
- 557 Effects of Gamma Radiation on the Allergenic and Antigenic Properties of Milk 558 Proteins. J. Food Prot. 64, 272-276.
- Lomax, M. E., Gulston, M. K., & O'Neill, P., 2002. Chemical aspects of clustered DNA
  damage induction by ionising radiation. Radiat. Prot. Dosimetry, 99(1-4), 63-68.
- 561 López-Malo, A., & Palou, E., 2005. Ultraviolet light and food preservation. In G. V. Barbosa-
- 562 Cánovas, M. S. Tapia, & M. P. Cano (Eds.), Novel food processing technologies (pp.
  563 405–421). Madrid: CRC
- Mathys, A., Heinz, V., Schwartz, F.H., Knorr, D., 2007. Impact of agglomeration on the
   quantitative assessment of *Bacillus stearothermophilus* heat inactivation. J. Food Eng.
- 566 <u>81, 380-387.</u>
- 567 Mazas, M., Martínez, S., López, M., Alvarez, A.B., Martin, R., 1999. Thermal inactivation of
- *Bacillus cereus* spores affected by the solutes used to control water activity of the heating
  medium. Int. J. Food Microbiol. 53, 61-67.
- 570 Moeller, R., Raguse, M., Reitz, G., Okayasu, R., Li, Z., Klein, S., Setlow, P., Nicholson,
- 571 W.L., 2014. Resistance of *Bacillus subtilis* Spore DNA to Lethal Ionizing Radiation
- 572 Damage Relies Primarily on Spore Core Components and DNA Repair, with Minor
- 573 Effects of Oxygen Radical Detoxification. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 80, 104-109.

- Nieto-Sandoval, J.M., Almela, L., Fernández-López, J.A., Muñoz, J.A., 2000. Effect of
  electron beam irradiation on color and microbial bioburden of red paprika. J. Food Prot.
  63, 633-637.
- 577 Palop, A., Raso, J., Pagán, R., Condón, S., Sala, F.J., 1996. Influence of pH on heat resistance
- of *Bacillus licheniformis* in buffer and homogenised foods. Int. J. Food Microbiol. 29, 110.
- Palop, A., Raso, J., Pagán, R., Condón, S., Sala, F.J., 1999. Influence of pH on heat resistance
  of spores of *Bacillus coagulans* in buffer and homogenized foods. Int. J. Food Microbiol.
  46, 243-249.
- Palop, A., Rutherford, G.C., & Marquis, R.E., 1998. Inactivation of enzymes within spores of
   *Bacillus megaterium* ATCC 19213 by hydroperoxides. Can. J. Microbiol. 44, 465-470.
- Sapru, V., Smerage, G., Teixeira, A., Lindsay, J., 1993. Comparison of predictive models for
  bacterial spore population resources to sterilization temperatures. J. Food Sci. 58, 223228.
- Sarrías, J.A., Valero, M., Salmerón, M.C., 2003. Elimination of *Bacillus cereus*contamination in raw rice by electron beam irradiation. Food Microbiol. 20, 327-332.
- Setlow, P., 1995. Mechanisms for the prevention of damage to DNA in spores of *Bacillus*species. Annu. Rev. Microbiol. 49, 29-54.
- 592 Setlow, P., 2006. Spores of *Bacillus subtilis*: their resistance to and killing by radiation, heat
   593 and chemicals . J. Appl. Microbiol. 101, 514-525.
- Sevenich, R., Reineke, K., Hecht, P., Fröhling, A., Rauh, C., Schlüter, O., Knorr, D., 2015.
  Impact of different water activities (aw) adjusted by solutes on high pressure high
  temperature inactivation of *Bacillus amyloliquefaciens* spores. Front. Microbiol. 6, 689.

- 597 Sutherland, B.M., Bennett, P.V., Sidorkina, O., Laval, J., 2000. Clustered Damages and Total
- 598 Lesions Induced in DNA by Ionizing Radiation: Oxidized Bases and Strand Breaks.
   599 Biochemistry 39, 8026-8031.
- 600 Syamaladevi, R.M., Tang, J., Villa-Rojas, R., Sablani, S., Carter, B., Campbell, G., 2016.
- 601 Influence of water activity on thermal resistance of microorganisms in low-moisture
- foods: a review. Compr. Rev. Food Sci. Food Saf. 15, 353-370.
- Thayer, D.W., Boyd, G., 1993. Elimination of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 in meats by gamma
  irradiation. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 59, 1030-1034.
- Thayer, D.W., Boyd, G., 2001. Effect of Irradiation Temperature on Inactivation of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 and *Staphylococcus aureus*. J. Food Prot. 64, 1624-1626.
- 607 Uemura, K., Isobe, S., 2003. Developing a new apparatus for inactivating Bacillus subtilis
- spore in orange juice with a high electric field AC under pressurized conditions. J. Food
  Eng. 56, 325-329.
- Valero, M., Sarrías, J.A., Álvarez, D., Salmerón, M.C., 2006. Modeling the influence of
  electron beam irradiation on the heat resistance of *Bacillus cereus* spores. Food
  Microbiol. 23, 367-37
- WHO 1981. Wholesomeness of irradiated food. Report of a joint FAO/IAEA/WHO expert
  committee, World Health Organization technical report series No. 659, Geneva.
- 615 WHO 1999. High dose irradiation, Wholesomeness of food irradiated with doses above 10
- kGy. Report of joint FAO/IAEA/WHO study group, World Health Organization
  technical report series No. 890, Geneva.
- 618 Yanniotis, S., Blahovec, J., 2009. Model analysis of sorption isotherms. LWT Food Sci.
- 619 <u>Technol. 42, 1688-1695.</u>

620	Yokoya, A., Shikazono, N., Fujii, K., Urushibara, A., Akamatsu, K., & Watanabe, R., 2008.
621	DNA damage induced by the direct effect of radiation. Radiat. Phys. Chem. 77(10),
622	<u>1280-1285.</u>
623	
624	
625	
626	
627	
628	
629	
630	
631	
	Y '

**Table 1.** Electron beam radiation resistance parameters obtained from the fitting of the
Geeraerd log-linear plus shoulder model (Equation 1) to the survival curves of <u>*B. mycoides*</u>,
<u>*B. weihenstephanensis*</u> and <u>*P. psychrodurans*</u> in citrate-phosphate buffers of different pH and

635 a<sub>w</sub>.

Microorganism	pН	a <sub>w</sub>	Sl <u>(kGy)</u>	<u>D<sub>10</sub> (kGy)</u>	RMSE
	7	>0.99	$0.6 (0.032)^{a}$	$0.8 (0.002)^{a}$	0.069
		0.90	$0.5 (0.243)^{abcd}$	1.5 (0.319) <sup>b</sup>	0.111
		0.80	$0.3 (0.063)^{bc}$	$1.9 (0.009)^{bc}$	0.115
	5.5	>0.99	$0.4 (0.005)^{c}$	1.0 (0.043) <sup>c</sup>	0.031
B. mycoides		0.90	-	$1.9(0.028)^{c}$	0.052
		0.80	-	$2.1 (0.068)^{c}$	0.101
	4	>0.99	0.5 (0.040) <sup>b</sup>	$0.9 (0.025)^{a}$	0.107
		0.90	0.3 (0.003) <sup>d</sup>	1.8 (0.046) <sup>bc</sup>	0.110
		0.80	0.3 (0.085) <sup>cd</sup>	$1.9 (0.016)^{bc}$	0.122
		>0.99	1.1 (0.067) <sup>a</sup>	0.9 (0.014) <sup>a</sup>	0.042
	7	0.90	1.9 (0.045) <sup>b</sup>	$1.6 (0.027)^{b}$	0.038
		0.80	$2.4(0.013)^{c}$	$1.4 (0.005)^{c}$	0.083
	5.5	>0.99	1.1 (0.064) <sup>a</sup>	0.9 (0.043) <sup>a</sup>	0.010
B. weihenstephanensis		0.90	$2.1 (0.060)^d$	$1.5(0.008)^d$	0.083
		0.80	$2.5(0.049)^{e}$	$1.4 (0.010)^{c}$	0.085
	4	>0.99	$1.2 (0.053)^{a}$	$0.8 (0.024)^{e}$	0.039
		0.90	1.8 (0.012) <sup>b</sup>	$1.6 (0.001)^{b}$	0.047
		0.80	$2.1 (0.117)^{d}$	$1.5(0.023)^{d}$	0.049
		>0.99	$0.2 (0.012)^{a}$	0.9 (0.002) <sup>a</sup>	0.076
	7	0.90	$0.3 (0.179)^{abc}$	$1.6(0.083)^{b}$	0.008
		0.80	$0.4 (0.003)^{b}$	$1.9(0.003)^{c}$	0.015
	5.5	>0.99	$0.3 (0.028)^{c}$	0.9 (0.001) <sup>a</sup>	0.060
P. psychrodurans		0.90	$1.0(0.028)^{d}$	$1.0(0.014)^{d}$	0.078
		0.80	$0.9 (0.012)^{e}$	$1.4 (0.061)^{e}$	0.020
	4	>0.99	-	0.7 (0.003) <sup>f</sup>	0.235
		0.90	0.8 (0.035) <sup>f</sup>	$1.0(0.013)^{d}$	0.080
		0.80	$0.9 (0.029)^{e}$	$1.3(0.024)^{e}$	0.041

637 a<sub>w</sub>, water activity; *Sl*, shoulder length;  $\underline{D}_{10}$ , decimal reduction dose calculated from  $k_{max}$  with 638 Equation 2 ; *RMSE*, root mean square error. Numbers in brackets represent standard deviation 639 of three replicates. Letters show differences within columns for each spore specie (p<0.05).

- 640 Table 2. Electron beam radiation resistance parameters obtained from the fitting of the
- 641 Geeraerd log-linear plus shoulder model (Equation 1) to the survival curves of *B. mycoides*,
- 642 <u>*B. weihenstephanensis*</u> and *P. psychrodurans* in white and brown crab meats.

		<u>D<sub>10</sub> (kGy)</u>	<i>Sl <u>(kGy)</u></i>	<u>6D (kGy)</u>	$R^2$	RMSE
XX 71 · 4	B. mycoides	0.8 (0.135) <sup>a,b</sup>	$1.3 (0.218)^{a}$	6.1 (0.038) <sup>a</sup>	0.99	0.026
white	B. weihenstephanensis	$1.0(0.063)^{a}$	$1.0 (0.067)^{a,d}$	7.3 (0.055) <sup>b</sup>	0.99	0.021
meat	P. psychrodurans	$0.8 (0.010)^{b}$	$0.6 (0.030)^{b}$	5.4 (0.019) <sup>c</sup>	0.99	0.039
D	B. mycoides	$0.9 (0.052)^{a}$	$0.8 (0.026)^{c}$	6.3 (0.118) <sup>d</sup>	0.99	0.012
Brown	B. weihenstephanensis	$1.1 (0.060)^{a}$	$1.0(0.018)^{a}$	7.6 (0.109) <sup>e</sup>	0.99	0.023
meat	P. psychrodurans	$0.7 (0.005)^{c}$	$0.9 (0.012)^d$	5.3 (0.007) <sup>f</sup>	0.99	0.038

<sup>643</sup> 

644 <u> $D_{10}$ </u>, decimal reduction dose (kGy) calculated from  $k_{max}$  whit Equation 2; *Sl*, shoulder length 645 (kGy); <u>6D</u>, necessary doses (kGy) to reached 6 Log<sub>10</sub>-reductions ; *RMSE*, root mean square 646 error;  $R^2$ , determination coefficient. <u>Numbers in brackets represent standard deviation of</u> 647 <u>three replicates. Letters show differences within columns (p<0.05).</u>

648

649

650

651

652

653

654

#### 656 Figure legend

- **Figure 1.** Survival curves to electron beam ionizing radiation at room temperature of *B. mycoides* (A), *B. weihenstephanensis* (B) and *P. psychrodurans* (C) in citrate-phosphate buffer of pH 7 and water activity ( $a_w$ ) of >0.99 ( $\textcircled{\bullet}$ ), 0.90 ( $\blacksquare$ ) and 0.80 ( $\blacktriangle$ ). Error bars
- 660 represent standard deviation of three replicates.
- **Figure 2.** Effect of the water activity (a<sub>w</sub>) on the dose necessary to reduce 6-Log<sub>10</sub> cycles of
- 662 *B. mycoides* (A), *B. weihenstephanensis* (B) and *P. psychrodurans* (C) at pH 7.0 (●), 5.5 (O)
- and 4.0 (•). Error bars represent standard deviation of three replicates.
- 664 **Figure 3.** Survival curves to electron beam ionizing radiation at room temperature of *B*.
- 665 <u>mycoides</u> ( $\bullet$ ), *B. weihenstephanensis* ( $\blacksquare$ ) and *P. psychrodurans* ( $\blacktriangle$ ) in crab's white meat
- 666 (A) and brown meat (B). Error bars represent standard deviation of three replicates.
- Figure 4. Specific resistance of *B. mycoides* (black bars), *B. weihenstephanensis* (grey bars)
  and *P. psychrodurans* (white bars) to different inactivation technologies in citrate-phosphate
  buffer of pH 7.0 and a<sub>w</sub> >0.99 (data for MS, MTS and Heat are adapted from Condon-Abanto
- 670 et al., 2016).
- 671

672

674 Figure 1



678











Figure 3 









Figure 4 699





718	SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIAL
719	Figure S1. Survival curves to electron beam ionizing radiation at room temperature of <i>B</i> .
720	mycoides (A), B. weihenstephanensis (B) and P. psychrodurans (C) in citrate-phosphate
721	buffer of pH 5.5 and water activity $(a_w)$ of >0.99 ( $\bigcirc$ ), 0.90 ( $\blacksquare$ ) and 0.80 ( $\blacktriangle$ ). Error bars
722	represent standard deviation of three replicates.
723	<b>Figure S2.</b> Survival curves to electron beam ionizing radiation at room temperature of <i>B</i> .
724	mycoides (A), B. weihenstephanensis (B) and P. psychrodurans (C) in citrate-phosphate
725	buffer of pH 4 and water activity $(a_w)$ of >0.99 ( $\bullet$ ), 0.90 ( $\blacksquare$ ) and 0.80 ( $\blacktriangle$ ). Error bars
726	represent standard deviation of three replicates.
727	
728	
729	
730	
731	
732	
733	
734	
736	
737	
738	
739	
740	
741	
742	
743	

**<u>Figure S1.</u>** 



**<u>Figure S2.</u>** 









## Highlight

- The effect of the treatment media pH was different for the different spores forming bacteria
- A protective effect of low  $a_w$  of the treatment medium was observed
- The protective effect of the reduction on  $a_w$  has the major effect in the range from >0.99 to 0.90
- Ionizing radiation could be a suitable technology to reduce the naturally present bacterial spore populations present in crab meat products