

Effect of freezing method and frozen storage duration on odour-active compounds and sensory perception of lamb

**Mónica Bueno^a; Virginia C. Resconi^b; M. Mar Campo^b; Juan Cacho^a; Vicente
Ferreira^a; Ana Escudero^{*a}**

*^aLaboratory for Aroma Analysis and Enology. Aragón Institute of Engineering
Research (I3A). Department of Analytical Chemistry, Faculty of Sciences, University of
Zaragoza, 50009, Zaragoza, Spain*

*^bDepartment of Animal Production and Food Science, University of Zaragoza, 50013,
Zaragoza, Spain*

* To whom correspondence should be addressed

Phone: 34976 762503

Fax: 34 976761292

Email: escudero@unizar.es

1 *Keywords*

2 Lamb aroma; freezing; carbonyl derivatization; grill extraction; odour-active
3 compounds

4

5 ABSTRACT

6 The effects of different freezing methods (nitrogen freezing tunnel, air blast freezer and
7 home freezer) and frozen storage duration (1 month and 10 months) have been studied
8 by sensory analyses and chemical analyses of odour-active compounds. The sensory
9 analyses showed that fresh meat was significantly ($p < 0.05$) juicier than frozen meat.
10 Meat frozen in the air blast freezer (ABF) and stored during 10 months had the highest
11 lamb flavour intensity, significantly different from meat frozen in a home freezer
12 (stored for 1 and 10 months) or in a nitrogen tunnel and stored for 1 month. The fresh
13 sample was characterized by lower levels of Strecker aldehydes, 2-phenoxyethanol,
14 cresols and to a lesser extent 2-methylbenzaldehyde, and higher levels of furaneol,
15 which was not even detected in frozen samples. These compounds, together with the
16 relative levels of octanoic acid and ethyl hexanoate, could be used as markers to detect
17 whether lamb meat has been frozen. In chemical terms, the ABF samples were the most
18 similar to fresh meat. Remarkably, in most cases the relative chemical aroma
19 composition had no significant differences as a result of freezing. This helps explain the
20 high sensory similarity observed. Only pyrazine levels changed significantly with
21 frozen storage duration. No oxidation aromas or rancidity have been detected in fresh or
22 frozen lamb.

23

24 **1. Introduction**

25 Lamb meat is widely consumed in Mediterranean countries, Spain being one of
26 the most important producers and consumers of this type of meat (Sanudo, Sanchez, &
27 Alfonso, 1998). While household consumption in Spain is much higher than in
28 restaurants, lamb meat is available in restaurants for most of the year (Albisu & Gracia,
29 2009). The seasonal supply of lambs is characteristic of the ovine market (Chemineau et
30 al., 1995), with a high supply during spring and a high demand at Christmas time. This
31 results in price fluctuations (Hansen et al., 2004). In order to increase profitability, meat
32 producers freeze meat in an attempt to stabilise its price (Pietrasik & Janz, 2009;
33 Wheeler, Miller, Savell, & Cross, 1990).

34 Freezing procedures need to ensure not only the nutritional quality, which has
35 already been demonstrated, but also the sensory quality of frozen meat. The latter is
36 closely linked to meat aroma. Consumers consider flavour one of the main sensory
37 properties decisive in their selection, acceptance, and ingestion of a particular food
38 (Fisher & Scott, 1997). Considering the importance of aroma in lamb meat quality,
39 several papers have examined its volatile profile (Elmore, Mottram, Enser, & Wood,
40 2000; Osorio, Zumalacarregui, Cabeza, Figueira, & Mateo, 2008; Priolo et al., 2004;
41 Young, Lane, Priolo, & Fraser, 2003); but none have studied the effect of freezing on
42 the aroma profile. Meat aroma can only be controlled if the chemical compounds
43 responsible for the most relevant sensory properties of fresh and frozen lamb are
44 quantified (Bueno et al., 2011; Campo et al., 2006; Muela, Sañudo, Campo, Medel, &
45 Beltrán, 2010; Young et al., 2003).

46 In general, it is thought that frozen meat is of lower quality than fresh meat
47 (Lagerstedt, Enfalt, Johansson, & Lundstrom, 2008). Thus, only 20% of consumers

48 always freeze meat and 19.7% freeze for more than a month. Eighty eight percent of
49 consumers would not buy thawed meat and 63% of consumers do not eat meat frozen-
50 thawed in a restaurant (Muela, Sañudo, Campo, Medel, & Beltrán, 2009). This shows a
51 lack of knowledge of the restoration operation.

52 The quality of frozen meat depends on the specific procedures used to freeze the
53 meat, the conditions of frozen storage (duration, temperature and its fluctuation,
54 exposure to light and/or air), and the thawing rate (Jasper & Placzek, 1980). The
55 freezing rate (related to time-temperature) can affect the quality of meat (Berry &
56 Leddy, 1989; Smith, Spaeth, Carpente, King, & Hoke, 1968; Uttaro & Aalhus, 2007)
57 through the structural changes that occur during freezing. In this work, a nitrogen
58 freezing tunnel was used because of its high freezing rate, an air blast freezer was used
59 for its versatility (in freezing and refrigeration), and a static air chamber was used
60 because of its similarity to a home freezer.

61 Although frozen foods are microbiologically stable, they are prone to
62 deterioration during storage due to chemical reactions (Akkose & Aktas, 2008), since
63 enzymatic activity slows down but does not cease (Devine, Graham, Lovatt, &
64 Chrystall, 1995; Jiménez & Carballo, 2000). The main deterioration in frozen meat is
65 due to the processes of lipid oxidation and protein degradation (Zhang, Farouk, Young,
66 Wieliczko, & Podmore, 2005), muscle tissues being especially susceptible. These
67 processes can determine the end point of the display life of frozen products (Jiménez &
68 Carballo, 2000). Storing frozen meat during one month is a common practice in
69 households, but to cover the period of sexual inactivity of small ruminants or even
70 export, long periods are necessary (10 months, for example).

71 This study assesses the effects of freezing methods and frozen storage durations
72 on sensory perception and odour active compounds. Both thawed and fresh meat are
73 evaluated.

74

75 **2. Materials and methods**

76 *2.1 Samples, freezing and frozen storage*

77 This study used 70 Rasa Aragonesa male lambs (approximately seventy days
78 old) with a cold carcass mean weight of 11.5 ± 0.1 kg. The animals were fed in the same
79 facilities under intensive husbandry conditions with no grazing (Pastores Grupo
80 Cooperativo), with natural suckling during the first 40 days and fodder with
81 concentrated ad libitum, mainly barley and maize, until slaughtering in a EU-licensed
82 abattoir following standard protocols. The slaughter date was 1 or 10 months (frozen
83 storage duration, FSD) before meat analysis. For each FSD, 30 carcasses were selected
84 randomly among the commercial lambs slaughtered on the corresponding slaughter
85 date. The slaughtering protocol has been described by Muela et al. (2010) in a previous
86 work. As can be seen in Fig. 1, at 4 days post-slaughter, the left side of the carcasses,
87 minus the neck, shoulder, flank and leg, were divided into two parts (one from the 5th
88 thoracic to the 13th thoracic, T5-T13, and the other from the 1st lumbar to the 6th lumbar
89 vertebrae, L1-L6) which were randomly allocated to one of three freezing methods
90 (FM) (10 carcasses for each FM): air blast freezer (dynamic air chamber) (-30°C , 90%
91 relative humidity, $1\text{--}2\text{ m s}^{-1}$, 3 days), nitrogen freezing tunnel (-40°C , 96% relative
92 humidity, 0.3 m min^{-1} , 15 min), and home freezer (static air chamber) (-18°C). To
93 prevent freezer burn and water losses, each part of the carcass (T5-T13, L1-L6) was
94 over-wrapped in a retractile oxygen-permeable plastic film (permeability 10 g m^{-2}
95 water, $200\text{ cc m}^{-2}/24\text{ h O}_2$, and $650\text{ cc m}^{-2}/24\text{ h CO}_2$) matching similar conservation
96 procedures at home. After being frozen using one of the FMs, the samples were stored
97 at -18°C , allocated for each FM for 10 months or 1 month. Before conducting the
98 instrumental measurements and the sensorial analysis of the meat, the samples were
99 thawed in a refrigerator ($2\text{--}4^{\circ}\text{C}$) for 24 h inside their plastic over-wrap. After thawing,

100 the *Longissimus thoracis* and *lumborum* muscles were excised with the subcutaneous
101 fat, vacuum packed and kept at 2-4 °C 24 h before being analysed. T5-T13 samples
102 were used for the carbonyl compound quantification and L1-L6 samples were used for
103 the sensorial analysis, the thiobarbituric acid-reactive substances method (TBARS) and
104 other volatile quantifications. The remaining 10 carcasses were not frozen and served as
105 a control group. These animals were subjected to the same slaughter, chilling, splitting
106 and wrapping procedures as described above, but instead of freezing, the fresh meat
107 samples were aged in a refrigerator (0–4 °C) for 6 days. This is equivalent to the total
108 time of the ageing of the thawed meat (96 h previous to freezing + 24 h during thawing
109 + 24 h after excision).

110 *2.2 Reagents, standards and materials*

111 *2.2.1 Solvents*

112 Dichloromethane, methanol, hexane and diethyl ether (gas chromatography
113 quality) were purchased from Merk (Darmstadt, Germany). Ethanol was supplied by
114 Panreac (Barcelona, Spain). Water was purified in a Milli-Q system from Millipore
115 (Bedford, Germany).

116 *2.2.2 SPE cartridge materials*

117 LiChrolut EN[®] resins (styrene/divinylbenzene copolymer) and 1 mL internal
118 volume polypropylene cartridges were supplied by Merk. Glass wool was purchased
119 from Panreac. Semiautomated solid phase extraction was carried out with a VAC ELUT
120 20 station system from Varian (Wallnut Creek, CA, USA).

121 *2.2.3. Chemical Standards*

122 Sodium sulfate anhydrous 99% and sodium hydrogencarbonate 99.7% were
123 supplied by Panreac; (E,E)-2,4-decadienal and 3-methylbutanoic acid 98% by Lancaster

124 (Eastgate, UK); sulfuric acid (95–97%, synthesis grade) by Scharlau (Barcelona, Spain);
125 2,6-dimethylpyrazine $\geq 98\%$ by SAFC (Steinheim, Germany); m-cresol 99%, 2-
126 phenoxyethanol 98%, 2-isopropyl-3-methoxypyrazine 97%, 2-methylbenzaldehyde
127 97%, 2,5-dimethyl-4-hydroxy-3(2H)-furanone (furanol) 98%, 2-ethyl-3(5 or 6)-
128 dimethylpyrazine 95%, 2-methylpropanal (isobutyraldehyde) 99%, 2-methylbutanal
129 95%, 3-methylbutanal (isovaleraldehyde) 97%, pentanal (valeraldehyde) 97%, hexanal
130 98%, octanal 99%, nonanal 95%, decanal (95%), (E)-2-hexenal 98%, (E)-2-octenal
131 94%, (E)-2-nonenal 97%, (E)-2-decenal $>92\%$, (E,E)-2,4-heptadienal 90%, (E,E)-2,4-
132 nonadienal $\geq 85\%$, 2-heptanone 98%, 2-octanone 98%, 2-nonanone 99% and 2,3,6-
133 trichloroanisole 99% used as internal standard for carbonyl compounds by Aldrich
134 (Madrid, Spain). Heptanal $\geq 95\%$, (E)-2-heptenal 98%, 1-octen-3-one $>99\%$, p-cresol
135 $\geq 99\%$, octanoic acid 98%, butanoic acid 99.5%, ethyl hexanoate 99%, 2-octanol 99.5%
136 used as internal standard for other volatile compounds, 5-chloro-2-pentanone $\geq 97\%$
137 used as surrogate for carbonyl compounds and O-(2,3,4,5,6-
138 pentafluorobenzyl)hydroxylamine hydrochloride (PFBHA) 99% used as derivatization
139 reagent for carbonyl compounds were supplied by Fluka (Madrid, Spain). The 5 mg mL⁻¹
140 solution of PFBHA was prepared daily.

141 2.3 Instrumental measurements

142 2.3.1 pH

143 To determine the instrumental characteristics of the raw meat before freezing,
144 pH analysis was performed prior to chilling at 24 hours after slaughtering. A portable
145 CRISON 507 pH-meter equipped with a penetrating electrode was used to measure the
146 pH of the left *Longissimus thoracis* and *lumborum* muscles. The average values found
147 were 5.61 ± 0.03 .

148 *2.3.2. Level of oxidation (TBARS)*

149 To assess lipid oxidation, meat samples were obtained from the 1st lumbar
150 vertebra. The assay was performed using the thiobarbituric acid-reactive substances
151 method (TBARS) (Pfalzgraf, Frigg, & Steinhart, 1995). For this purpose a UNICAM
152 5625 UV/VIS spectrometer was used.

153 *2.4 Loin grilling*

154 Samples were kept at ambient temperature (20 °C) during 1 h before analysis to
155 achieve an internal muscle temperature of 15°C prior to cooking. The muscles (T5-T13
156 muscle mean weight = 154 ± 5 g and L1-L6 muscle mean weight = 202 ± 7 g) were
157 wrapped in aluminium foil and grilled (with the fat side up) on an industrial double-
158 plate grill (GRS-5 SAMMIC) at 200 °C until the internal temperature was 70 °C
159 (Resconi, Campo, Furnols, Montossi, & Sanudo, 2009), which was monitored by a
160 JENWAY 2000 internal thermocouple. Once grilled, the subcutaneous fat and external
161 connective tissue were removed.

162 *2.5 Sensory analysis*

163 A trained nine-member tasting panel (ISO 8586-1, 1993) evaluated the meat
164 samples using a quantitative descriptive analysis. A total of 63 samples, 9 replicates per
165 treatment, were tasted, obtaining a total of 81 judgements per treatment. Prior to sensory
166 analysis, the cooked muscle (L1-L6) was cut into 9 portions which were wrapped in
167 aluminium foil and identified with a single random three-digit code. The samples were
168 kept warm in a heater at 50 °C until they were served to the tasting panel (<10 min after
169 being cooked). To minimize the possibility of an effect of the order of presentation and
170 carryover effects, the samples were presented in a sequence that followed a balanced
171 design (Macfie, Bratchell, Greenhoff, & Vallis, 1989). The sessions took place in a

172 controlled sensory analysis laboratory (ISO 8589, 1988) equipped with individual
173 booths and red lights. To cleanse their palate between samples, panellists were given
174 bottle water and breadsticks.

175 The sensory profile and specific training were developed in an additional session
176 using 7 samples from each of the seven treatments (three different FM x two different
177 FSD + not frozen meat). The test used a quantitative descriptive method within an
178 incomplete and balanced design (Cochran & Cox, 1978) that included 21 plates
179 containing three samples each. There were five testing sessions (over three days in three
180 consecutive weeks) with four plates per session (five in the first session). The analysis
181 was based on 11 sensory descriptors (Table 1) chosen by the panellists during the
182 training session. The panel evaluated the meat samples on a 10 cm semi-structured and
183 continuous scale in which intensity ranged from very low (0) to very high (10), and
184 overall likeness ranged from very bad (0) to very good (10).

185 *2.6 Extraction of volatile compounds*

186 The cartridges hand-making, conditioning, drying and grill extraction procedures
187 have been described in a previous work (Bueno et al., 2011). Meat volatiles were
188 collected during grilling until the muscle internal temperature of two loins (requirement
189 to have enough sensitivity) was 70 °C.

190 *2.7 Carbonyl compounds quantification*

191 *2.7.1 Derivatization*

192 Derivatization was carried out directly in the cartridge after the extraction
193 procedure using a variation of the method described in the literature (Zapata, Mateo-
194 Vivaracho, Cacho, & Ferreira, 2010). In our case, the cartridges contained 100 mg of
195 LiChrolut EN[®] resins so that only half of the reagents, cleaning solvents and

196 derivatizing agent aqueous solution were necessary. Before the derivatization process,
197 200 μL of 5-chloro-2-pentanone 2.5 mg L^{-1} standard solution in 25% ethanol (v/v) in
198 Milli-Q water (surrogate), prepared daily, were loaded onto the cartridge. Prior to the
199 elution process, glass wool was removed from the cartridges. Derivatized analytes were
200 finally eluted with 1 mL of 10% diethyl ether (v/v) in hexane and 30 μL of 2,3,6-
201 trichloroanisole 20 mg L^{-1} were added as internal standard. The extracts were dried with
202 sodium sulfate anhydrous and analyzed by GC-NCI-MS. Two blank samples must be
203 prepared per session by applying the whole procedure to a cartridge.

204 2.7.2 GC-NCI-MS

205 Two microlitres of each extract were injected in a Shimadzu QP-2010 gas
206 chromatograph with a quadrupole mass spectrometric detection system. The standard
207 split/splitless injector was operated in splitless mode. The temperature of the injector
208 was kept at 250°C , and a pressure pulse of 467 KPa was applied during 1.5 min (the
209 column flow during this period of time was 2.69 mL min^{-1}). The carrier gas was He at a
210 constant linear velocity of 35 cm s^{-1} ($\approx 0.62 \text{ mL min}^{-1}$ flow rate). The column was a
211 DB-5 capillary column from J&W (Folsom, CA, USA), 20 m x 0.18 mm i.d., with 0.18
212 μm film thickness, preceded by a silica precolumn from Supelco (Bellefonte, PA,
213 USA), 3 m x 0.25 mm i.d.. The chromatographic oven was held at 45°C for 2 min, then
214 raised to 200°C at $10^\circ\text{C min}^{-1}$ and finally to 280°C at $25^\circ\text{C min}^{-1}$; remaining at that
215 temperature for 3 min. The ion source was operated in NCI mode using methane at 3
216 bars as reagent gas. The temperature of the ion source was 220°C and the transfer line
217 was kept at 250°C . The mass analyzer was operated in single ion monitoring (SIM)
218 mode. The selected ions for each analyte are shown in Table 2. The derivatization
219 process was monitored using a surrogate (5-chloro-2-pentanone). For the quantification
220 of the internal standard (2,3,6-trichloroanisole) and the surrogate, mass 35 was used.

221 The solvent cut window was 9.4 min. Quantitative data were obtained by interpolation
222 of ionic peak areas relative to the internal standard in the calibration graphs built by the
223 analysis of water containing known amounts of the analytes. The quantity (ng) is
224 referred to the litres of headspace trapped during the grilling of two lamb loins.

225 *2.8 Quantification of other volatiles*

226 For the quantification of other volatiles which are not carbonyls, the compounds
227 were directly eluted after extraction. Glass wool was removed prior to the elution
228 process by cutting the cartridge. The compounds were then eluted with 1 mL of
229 dichloromethane containing 5% methanol (v/v) (Ferreira et al., 2009). 40 μ L of 2-
230 octanol 12 mg L⁻¹ were added as internal standard. The extracts were dried with sodium
231 sulfate anhydrous and concentrated under nitrogen stream until 200 μ L.

232

233 *2.8.1 Multidimensional gas chromatography-olfactometry-mass spectrometry* 234 *(GC-GC-O-MS)*

235 Ten microlitres of each extract were injected into a multidimensional gas
236 chromatograph system supplied by Varian (Walnut Creek, CA, USA). The system
237 consisted of two independent CP 3800 chromatographs interconnected by a
238 thermoregulated transfer line kept at 200°C equipped with a Deans valve switching
239 system (Valco Instruments, Houston, TX), two olfactory ports, a 1079 PTV
240 (Programmable Temperature Vaporizing) injector, flame ionization detection (FID) and
241 an ion trap mass spectrometric-detector (Varian 240-MS), as described in Bueno et al.
242 (2011).

243 In four chromatographic runs for each extract, selective heart-cuttings were
244 performed to isolate the odorants of interest, detected by GCO in recent studies (Bueno
245 et al., 2011; Resconi et al., 2010). The odorants were transferred to the second oven and

246 monitored by MS detection (Table 2). The columns, oven temperature programs, PTV
247 conditions, delay time and heart-cutting interval were the same as those in Bueno et al.
248 (2011). Compound quantification was determined through two capillary columns and
249 the mass spectra to obtain not only sensitivity but also more selectivity, because direct
250 extracts have a large number of compounds. Heart-cuttings were done to avoid
251 coelutions in the second column. The quantification was carried out with relative ionic
252 peak areas and using response factor so that the mass of the collected analytes was
253 known. The response factor was calculated by the GC-GC-MS analysis of
254 dichloromethane-methanol solutions containing known amounts of the standards.
255 Knowing the volume of fumes extracted during the grilling of two lamb loins, the
256 concentration of the compounds present in the fumes generated is known.

257 *2.9 Statistical analysis and data treatment*

258 Chromatographic data treatment was carried out because of the lack of
259 reproducibility in meat analysis. This is due to the variability between animals, the
260 variability in the shape and weight of the loins and thus the variability in cooking times.
261 For each chromatogram, the analyte in which it was most abundant was assigned a
262 value of 100. Other analytes in the same sample were expressed as percentages in
263 relation to the most abundant. We worked with both the absolute quantity of the
264 analytes (concentration in the generated fumes) and the relative values of the analytes.

265 For the sensory data, the quantitative data of the analytes (absolute and relative),
266 and the TBARS data, a General Linear Model (GLM) was applied with SPSS 15.0
267 software, considering treatment as a fixed effect (3 freezing methods x 2 frozen storage
268 durations + fresh meat). Differences between treatments were assessed using a Duncan
269 test ($p < 0.05$). Another GLMs were applied for analyte quantitative data (absolute and
270 relative) and TBARS data considering FM and FSD as fixed effects. Another GLM was

271 applied for analyte quantitative data (absolute and relative) considering frozen and non-
272 frozen as a fixed effect.

273 The data relating to the significant sensory attributes and significant (in any of
274 the GLMs performed) aromatic compounds (ng L^{-1}) were subjected to a Principal
275 Component Analysis (PCA) using The Unscrambler 9.7 statistical software.

276

277 **3. Results and discussion**

278 *3.1 Level of oxidation (TBARS)*

279 All the samples obtained values from 0.045 to 0.233 μg malonaldehyde g^{-1} meat
280 (average treatment values are shown in Table 3). These oxidation levels were lower than
281 the threshold value for rancid flavour detection of 0.5 μg malonaldehyde g^{-1} meat
282 proposed by Tarladgis, Watts, Younathan, & Dugan (1960) or the even higher threshold
283 of 2 μg g^{-1} for ruminants (Campo et al., 2006) at which consumers detect an off-flavour.
284 Although intensive rearing conditions based on cereals imply less natural antioxidants
285 in the feed than grazing rearing conditions, lipid oxidation was this low after 10 months
286 of storage probably because the loin was kept intact under freezing conditions, which
287 reduces the rate of deterioration.

288 The control samples (non frozen lamb) differ significantly ($p < 0.001$) from those
289 of the other 6 treatments (3 FM x 2 FSD). The values from fresh meat were lower than
290 those obtained from frozen meat. Leaving aside this control treatment, the frozen
291 samples were compared and the FM and FSD effects were studied. It was concluded
292 that there were no significant differences resulting from the different FMs but that the
293 FSD did produce such differences ($p < 0.05$). No interaction was found between these
294 two effects. This result is slightly different to the findings of Muela et al. (2010) that
295 both FM and FSD had highly significant effects on oxidation ($p < 0.001$). As was
296 expected, the longer the storage duration, the higher the amount of malonaldehyde
297 formed. This result is consistent with the finding of Muela et al. (2010). In any case,
298 these TBARS results are proof that all the samples were properly handled since the
299 results are consistent.

300 *3.2 Sensory analysis*

301 The sensory panel test on the *Longissimus lumborum* muscle showed that most
302 attributes suffered no detrimental effects from freezing. Only 3 of the 12 sensory
303 attributes were significantly affected by treatment. Table 4 illustrates the significant
304 influence of different treatments on the organoleptic quality of lamb.

305 Lamb and fat odour intensities were under the mid 10 cm scale, consistent with
306 the type of lamb studied (light lambs fed with concentrates, Sanudo et al., 1998) and
307 with higher scores than those for the odour intensity of old meat (also consistent with
308 the young age of the lambs, Young, Berdague, Viallon, RoussetAkrim, & Theriez,
309 1997). Furthermore, the lamb odour did not show detrimental freezing effects, in
310 agreement with the findings of Muela, Sañudo, Campo, Medel, & Beltrán (2012). This
311 was also reflected in the lack of significant differences between fresh and thawed meat
312 in odour attributes.

313 In the case of flavour, the lamb intensities differed significantly. Meat frozen in
314 the air blast freezer during 10 months had the highest score, and sensory differences
315 with meat frozen in a home freezer (1 and 10 months) or in a nitrogen tunnel for 1
316 month could be appreciated. The lamb and fat flavour scores were higher than the
317 scores of the other flavour attributes, being at the middle of the 10 cm scale. If the fresh
318 lamb score is removed, there is a correlation between the lamb and fat flavour ($r =$
319 0.91). On the other hand, there were significant differences in the acid flavour between
320 meat frozen in the air blast freezer during 1 month, and in the home freezer and in the
321 nitrogen freezing tunnel during 1 month. In any case, the meat had low acid scores.
322 Acid flavours appear in beef aged more than 7 days, and can be associated with
323 enzymatic degradation processes which occur in meat throughout the ageing process
324 (Spanier, Flores, McMillin, & Bidner, 1997).

325 The greasiness attribute had low scores but was noticeable enough, maybe due to
326 the cooking methodology with the fat side up (Bueno et al., 2011). The meat was more
327 easily impregnated with the fat. Independently of the treatment, tenderness was
328 perceived on the high part of the scale, either due to the age of the animal (only 70 days)
329 or probably because of the ageing period (6 days). Ageing promotes tenderness through
330 the enzymatic degradation of myofibrils (Penny, 1984) and 6 days are long enough to
331 consider lamb meat as tender. Typically, meat tenderness and juiciness are positively
332 correlated. In the present work, they are correlated ($r = 0.90$) if the fresh meat data is
333 removed, but tenderness was not significantly affected by the treatment probably
334 because all the treatments had the same ageing period and, as already stated, 6 days is a
335 sufficiently long ageing period. Hopkins et al. (2006) found that all the sensory traits
336 improved as the proportion of intramuscular fat increased. In this study, the lambs had
337 been subject to the same feeding system, had nearly the same carcass mean weight and
338 therefore similar fatness, and were of the same age at slaughter. Consequently, no
339 significant differences would be expected in texture parameters (tenderness, juiciness
340 and untuousity), as was the case reported by Muela (Muela et al., 2012). Ageing prior to
341 freezing was the same and sufficiently long in all the treatments (Vieira, Diaz, Martinez
342 & Garcia-Cachan, 2009). Nevertheless, in our case juiciness was significantly affected
343 by the treatment when differentiating between fresh and frozen meat. Since all the
344 samples were thawed in the same way, it could be said that the significant difference
345 found in juiciness only depends on the freezing methods, probably because changes in
346 juiciness are caused by the loss of water due to cell structure disruptions (Farouk &
347 Swan, 1998).

348 In conclusion, looking at all the data as a whole, it can be said that freezing did
349 not damage the sensorial quality of the lamb. The hedonic preference of the panel did

350 not penalise frozen meat, perhaps because these consumers were used to frozen meat at
351 their home, as is the case in other countries (64% in New Zealand and 87% in Australia,
352 Gilbert et al., 2007). A panel is not representative of the population, so its hedonic
353 values must be considered with care. In any case there are studies which state that panel
354 hedonic values can subsequently be correlated with consumer acceptability (Resano,
355 Sanjuan, Cilla, Roncales, & Albisu, 2010).

356

357 *3.3 Relationship between odour-active compounds and sensory perception*

358 Most aroma-active chemical compounds in grilled meat have been quantified in
359 order to gain a more complete understanding of the flavour-related phenomena taking
360 place during the storage of frozen meat. In all, 36 compounds were quantified in the
361 grilled meat samples (Tables 2, 5 and 6). The target aroma chemicals were selected
362 having regard to the scientific literature, taking into account all those that have been
363 found to be odour-active or related to the freezing process. In recent studies (Bueno et
364 al., 2011), ethyl hexanoate and butanoic and 3-methylbutanoic acids were found at high
365 levels in frozen samples. In the same study, pyrazines and octanoic acid were found in
366 samples obtained directly from the grill, and these have also been targeted in this work.
367 In addition, three of the quantified pyrazines have been previously described as
368 important contributors to goat meat (Madruga, Elmore, Dodson, & Mottram, 2009).
369 Other compounds identified for the first time in lamb (Bueno et al., 2011), such as 2-
370 isopropyl-3-methoxypyrazine and 2-methylbenzaldehyde, have also been quantified in
371 this work. Caporaso, Sink, Dimick, Mussinan, & Sanderson (1977) suggested 10
372 aldehydes, 3 ketones and 1 lactone as the most important compounds in lamb flavour.
373 Six of these carbonyl compounds (hexanal, heptanal, octanal, nonanal, (E)-2-octenal

374 and (E,E)-2,4-decadienal) were found to be sensory active in other studies (Bueno et al.,
375 2011; Resconi et al., 2010) and have also been studied here. Other analytes (strecker
376 derivates, saturated aldehydes, 2-ketones, (E)-2-alkenals, (E,E)-2,4-alkadienals and
377 cresols) have been previously identified in Tenax fractions (Elmore et al., 2005;
378 Sutherland & Ames, 1995; Young et al., 1997) in the headspace aroma of grilled lamb.
379 Finally, some odorants with meaty odours ((E)-2-heptenal, RI_{DB-WAX} 1473/RI_{VF-5} 1168
380 barbecue, (E)-2-decenal, (E,E)-2,4-decadienal, 2-acetyl-2-thiazoline) have been
381 identified by GC-O in a previous work (Bueno et al., 2011). Most of these compounds
382 are lipid oxidation products, Strecker reaction products from amino acids or Maillard
383 reaction products.

384 The absolute quantities of the target aroma chemicals, expressed in ng L⁻¹,
385 contained in the fumes generated during the grilling of the different meat samples are
386 given in Table 5. Significant differences between the means of the treatments are
387 indicated by different superscripts. The aroma chemical data has been processed in both
388 absolute and relative values (see section 2.9), and the significance of the major factors
389 considered in the study is compiled for both sets of data in Table 6. In addition, a
390 Principal Component Analysis was carried out on discriminant chemical and sensory
391 data, and the projection of the samples and variable loadings on the first two
392 components is plotted in Fig. 2.

393 Regarding the absolute content in aroma compounds, the data in Table 5 and the
394 plot in Fig. 2 reveal that the meat sample frozen in the freezing tunnel after 10 months
395 of storage (sample NTF10m) showed the greatest difference in relation to all the other
396 samples in terms of its absolute aroma composition. This is consistent with the
397 organoleptic data reported by Muela et al. (2012). This sample produced the highest

398 levels of some carbonyl compounds, notably aliphatic aldehydes and 2-ketones, and
399 also of (E)-2-octenal, (E,E)-2,4-heptadienal and (E,E)-2,4-nonadienal.

400 In this paper the lamb oxidation level has been studied in three ways: first with
401 TBARS analyses, secondly with carbonyl compound analyses and thirdly with sensory
402 analysis. It was expected that the results of the first method would not match the results
403 of the second and third methods because the TBARS is carried out on uncooked meat
404 while the carbonyl quantification of the aroma release during cooking and the sensory
405 analysis are carried out on cooked meat. If all the tests had been carried out on
406 uncooked meat, the results might have been the same (Olivares et al., 2011).
407 Nevertheless, the conclusions in our study remain the same: no oxidation aromas or
408 rancidity from lipids have been found in either fresh or frozen lamb.

409

410 The data reveal that the fresh meat sample is characterized by a relatively small
411 number of compositional differences from the other samples, although some of them
412 become significant. In particular, this sample had the smallest levels of Strecker
413 aldehydes (2-methylpropanal, 2-methylbutanal and 3-methylbutanal), p- and m-cresols,
414 and to a lesser extent, 2-methylbenzaldehyde, and the maximum levels of furaneol (see
415 also Table 6, last column). All these compounds, particularly furaneol, can in this sense
416 be considered as general markers for freezing.

417 The plot in Fig. 2 also reveals a clear separation of freezing methods. The
418 nitrogen freezing tunnel is positively correlated to the first component, the house freezer
419 is negatively correlated with PC1 and positively correlated with PC2, whereas the air
420 blast freezer is negatively correlated with both PCs. This last freezing method is
421 positively correlated to butanoic and 3-methylbutanoic acid, in accordance with Bueno

422 et al. (2011) who reported high modified frequency percentages in air blast frozen
423 samples. In any case the plot suggests from the aroma chemical composition point of
424 view that the ABF treatment produces samples most similar to fresh meat, and in this
425 sense it is the most efficient. Remarkably, from the chemical point of view the effect of
426 storage time is negligible in HF and ABF treatments, since samples stored for 1 or 10
427 months have an almost identical chemical composition, suggesting that in these
428 treatments changes can be essentially attributed to the freezing process and not to the
429 storage itself (see also Table 6, columns four and six).

430 If chemical changes are clear but not very intense in absolute terms, they
431 become almost negligible when it comes to relative terms (Table 6, all the columns
432 headed by “relative values”). When we compare the chemical aroma profile (the relative
433 content of each aroma component in each sample), in most cases differences between
434 samples are purely random and cannot be clearly attributed to any of the studied factors.
435 These results are summarized in Table 6, in which the columns give the significance
436 level reached by the differences between treatments, between frozen treatments without
437 the fresh treatment and between fresh and frozen samples. In this last case, for instance,
438 it can be seen that the relative content of fresh samples does not differ from that of
439 frozen samples except in the levels of furaneol, octanoic acid, ethyl hexanoate and, to a
440 lesser extent, 2-phenoxyethanol. The fumes from fresh meat contained a higher
441 proportion of octanoic acid, ethyl hexanoate (this last result is contrary to what was
442 found recently, Bueno et al., 2011) ($p < 0.01$) and, of course, of furaneol which was not
443 even detected in frozen meat ($p < 0.001$). On the other hand, 2-phenoxyethanol values are
444 lower in fresh meat than in frozen meat ($p < 0.1$).

445 We cannot yet offer a satisfactory explanation for the absence of furaneol in the
446 frozen meats. It may be related to the release of intermolecular water due to disruptions

447 in the cell walls caused by microcrystals formed during the freezing process (Ballin &
448 Lametsch, 2008). It may be that such water is partly drained off during the thawing
449 process, dragging with it fructose-1,6-diphosphate, the predominant precursor of the
450 odorant furaneol (Schieberle, 1992). It could be that just the change of the water activity
451 has a deep influence on the grilling proces. In any case, the possibility that the absence
452 of this strong odorant in frozen samples can be related to the lower level of juiciness
453 noted in these sets of samples is of considerable interest and deserves further scientific
454 attention.

455 Returning to Table 6, it can be seen that the relative levels of the four pyrazines
456 changed significantly with the duration of the frozen storage, increasing with the
457 duration.

458 Leaving aside furaneol, Table 6 reveals that the differences in relative terms are
459 marginal. This would help explain the small sensory differences noted between the
460 different samples, as previously discussed (Table 4). These low levels of sensory
461 differences can be related to the fact that “odor concepts” and “flavour concepts” in
462 general are more related to the profile of chemicals than to their absolute quantities,
463 which are more closely related to the intensity (Ferreira, 2012a, 2012b). From this point
464 of view, the lack of oxidation aromas or rancidity (Table 4) can be explained by the fact
465 that the sensory levels of rancid-smelling compounds were never too high (Table 5). In
466 cases where they were a little bit higher, the other odorants were also at a higher level so
467 that the profile (relative amount) remained almost unchanged.

468

469 **4. Conclusions**

470 The sensory study has confirmed that frozen meat retains all the sensory characteristics
471 of fresh meat, except juiciness which was significantly smaller in all cases. The
472 different treatments, including storage time, seemed to have a limited effect on the
473 sensory properties. Besides, no oxidation aromas or rancidity have been detected in
474 fresh or frozen lamb. From the chemical point of view, the fresh sample was
475 characterized by smaller levels of Strecker aldehydes, 2-phenoxyethanol and cresols and
476 higher levels of furaneol, which was not even detected in frozen samples, and to a lesser
477 extent, 2-methylbenzaldehyde. These compounds, together with the relative levels of
478 octanoic acid and ethyl hexanoate, could be used as markers to detect when lamb meat
479 has been frozen. In chemical terms, the ABF samples were the most similar to fresh
480 meat. Remarkably, leaving aside furaneol, octanoic acid and ethyl hexanoate, the
481 chemical aroma profiles were very similar between samples, which could help explain
482 the high degree of sensory similarity observed. Only pyrazine profiles changed with the
483 duration of the storage, thus if meat is stored for 10 months under freezing conditions
484 the problem of seasonality in the ovine market can be solved.

485

486 **Acknowledgement**

487 This work has been made possible by financial support from the DGA (Project
488 PI046/08). M.B. has received a grant from the University of Zaragoza. For the use of
489 facilities we are grateful to the Pastores Group. We also thank the Animal Production
490 personnel at the Veterinary Faculty of the University of Zaragoza, the personnel of the
491 Laboratory for Aroma Analysis and Enology at the Faculty of Science of the University
492 of Zaragoza and the trained test panel for their technical assistance.

493

494 **References**

- 495 Akkose, A., & Aktas, N. (2008). Determination of glass transition temperature of beef
496 and effects of various cryoprotective agents on some chemical changes. *Meat*
497 *Science*, 80 (3), 875-878.
- 498 Albisu, L. M., & Gracia, A. (2009). La comercialización y consumo de la carne de
499 cordero en España. In C. Sañudo & R. Cepero (Eds.), *Ovinotecnia. Producción y*
500 *Economía en la especie ovina* (pp. 445-452). Zaragoza: Prensas Universitarias
501 de Zaragoza.
- 502 Ballin, N. Z., & Lametsch, R. (2008). Analytical methods for authentication of fresh vs.
503 thawed meat - A review. *Meat Science*, 80 (2), 151-158.
- 504 Berry, B. W., & Leddy, K. F. (1989). Effects of freezing rate, frozen storage-
505 temperature and storage time on tenderness values of beef patties. *Journal of*
506 *Food Science*, 54 (2), 291-296.
- 507 Bueno, M., Resconi, V. C., Campo, M. M., Cacho, J., Ferreira, V., & Escudero, A.
508 (2011). Gas chromatographic-olfactometric characterisation of headspace and
509 mouthspace key aroma compounds in fresh and frozen lamb meat. *Food*
510 *Chemistry*, 129 (4), 1909-1918.
- 511 Campo, M. M., Nute, G. R., Hughes, S. I., Enser, M., Wood, J. D., & Richardson, R. I.
512 (2006). Flavour perception of oxidation in beef. *Meat Science*, 72 (2), 303-311.
- 513 Caporaso, F., Sink, J. D., Dimick, P. S., Mussinan, C. J., & Sanderson, A. (1977).
514 Volatile flavor constituents of ovine adipose-tissue. *Journal of Agricultural and*
515 *Food Chemistry*, 25 (6), 1230-1234.
- 516 Cochran, W. G., & Cox, G. H. (1978). *Diseños experimentales*. Méjico.
- 517 Chemineau, P., Malpoux, B., Théry, J. C., Viguiè, C., Morello, H., Zarazaga, L., &
518 Pelletier, J. (1995). The control of seasonality: A challenge to small ruminant

519 breeding. In G. Enne, G. F. Greppi & A. Lauria (Eds.), *Reproduction and animal*
520 *breeding Advances and strategy* (pp. 225-250). Amsterdam: Elsevier Publishers
521 B.V.

522 Devine, C. E., Graham, R. G., Lovatt, S., & Chrystall, B. B. (1995). Red meats. In L. E.
523 Jeremiah (Ed.), *Freezing effects on food quality* (pp. 51-86).

524 Elmore, J. S., Cooper, S. L., Enser, M., Donald, S. M. A., Sinclair, L. A., Wilkinson, R.
525 G., & Wood, J. D. (2005). Dietary manipulation of fatty acid composition in
526 lamb meat and its effect on the volatile aroma compounds of grilled lamb. *Meat*
527 *Science*, *69* (2), 233-242.

528 Elmore, J. S., Mottram, D. S., Enser, M., & Wood, J. D. (2000). The effects of diet and
529 breed on the volatile compounds of cooked lamb. *Meat Science*, *55* (2), 149-159.

530 Farouk, M. M., & Swan, J. E. (1998). Effect of rigor temperature and frozen storage on
531 functional properties of hot-boned manufacturing beef. *Meat Science*, *49* (2),
532 233-247.

533 Ferreira, V. (2012a). Revisiting psychophysical work on the quantitative and qualitative
534 odour properties of simple odour mixtures: a flavour chemistry view. Part 1:
535 intensity and detectability. A review. *Flavour and Fragrance Journal*, *27* (2),
536 124-140.

537 Ferreira, V. (2012b). Revisiting psychophysical work on the quantitative and qualitative
538 odour properties of simple odour mixtures: a flavour chemistry view. Part 2:
539 qualitative aspects. A review. *Flavour and Fragrance Journal*, *27* (3), 201-215.

540 Ferreira, V., San Juan, F., Escudero, A., Cullere, L., Fernandez-Zurbano, P., Saenz-
541 Navajas, M. P., & Cacho, J. (2009). Modeling Quality of Premium Spanish Red
542 Wines from Gas Chromatography-Olfactometry Data. *Journal of Agricultural*
543 *and Food Chemistry*, *57* (16), 7490-7498.

544 Fisher, C., & Scott, T. R. (1997). *Food Flavours*. Cambridge: The Royal Society of
545 Chemistry.

546 Gilbert, S. E., Whyte, R., Bayne, G., Paulin, S. M., Lake, R. J., & van der Logt, P.
547 (2007). Survey of domestic food handling practices in New Zealand.
548 *International Journal of Food Microbiology*, 117 (3), 306-311.

549 Hansen, E., Juncher, D., Henckel, P., Karlsson, A., Bertelsen, G., & Skibsted, L. H.
550 (2004). Oxidative stability of chilled pork chops following long term freeze
551 storage. *Meat Science*, 68 (3), 479-484.

552 Hopkins, D. L., Hegarty, R.S., Walker, P. J. & Pethick, D.W. (2006). Relationship
553 between animal age, intramuscular fat, cooking loss, pH, shear force and eating
554 quality of aged meat from sheep. *Australian Journal of Experimental
555 Agriculture*, 46, 879-884.

556 Jasper, W., & Placzek, R. (1980). *Conservación de la carne por el frío*: Ed. Acribia.

557 Jiménez, F., & Carballo, J. (2000). Aplicaciones del frío a la carne y productos cárnicos.
558 In M. Lamúa (Ed.), *Aplicación del frío a los alimentos* (pp. 293-313). Madrid:
559 AMV Ediciones y Mundi Prensa.

560 Lagerstedt, A., Enfalt, L., Johansson, L., & Lundstrom, K. (2008). Effect of freezing on
561 sensory quality, shear force and water loss in beef *M. longissimus dorsi*. *Meat
562 Science*, 80 (2), 457-461.

563 Macfie, H. J., Bratchell, N., Greenhoff, K., & Vallis, L. V. (1989). Designs to balance
564 the effect of order of presentation and first-order carry-over effects in hall test
565 *Journal of Sensory Studies*, 4 (2), 129-148.

566 Madruga, M. S., Elmore, J. S., Dodson, A. T., & Mottram, D. S. (2009). Volatile
567 flavour profile of goat meat extracted by three widely used techniques. *Food
568 Chemistry*, 115 (3), 1081-1087.

- 569 Muela, E., Sañudo, C., Campo, M. M., Medel, I., & Beltrán, J. A. (2009). Encuestas a
570 consumidores: percepción y hábitos de consumo de carne de cordero congelada.
571 In *XIII Jornadas sobre Producción Animal* (Vol. Tomo II, pp. 601-603):
572 Asociación Inteprofesional para el Desarrollo Agrario (AIDA).
- 573 Muela, E., Sañudo, C., Campo, M. M., Medel, I., & Beltrán, J. A. (2010). Effect of
574 freezing method and frozen storage duration on instrumental quality of lamb
575 throughout display. *Meat Science*, *84* (4), 662-669.
- 576 Muela, E., Sañudo, C., Campo, M. M., Medel, I., & Beltrán, J. A. (2012). Effect of
577 freezing method and frozen storage duration on lamb sensory quality. *Meat*
578 *Science*, *90* (1), 209-215.
- 579 Olivares, A., Dryahina, K., Navarro, J. L., Smith, D., Spanel, P., & Flores, M. (2011).
580 SPME-GC-MS versus Selected Ion Flow Tube Mass Spectrometry (SIFT-MS)
581 Analyses for the Study of Volatile Compound Generation and Oxidation Status
582 during Dry Fermented Sausage Processing. *Journal of Agricultural and Food*
583 *Chemistry*, *59* (5), 1931-1938.
- 584 Osorio, M. T., Zumalacarregui, J. M., Cabeza, E. A., Figueira, A., & Mateo, J. (2008).
585 Effect of rearing system on some meat quality traits and volatile compounds of
586 suckling lamb meat. *Small Ruminant Research*, *78* (1-3), 1-12.
- 587 Penny, I. F. (1984). Enzimología de la maduración. In R. Lawrie (Ed.), *Avances de la*
588 *Ciencia de la Carne*. Zaragoza: Acribia, D.L.
- 589 Pfalzgraf, A., Frigg, M., & Steinhart, H. (1995). Alpha-Tocopherol contents and lipid
590 oxidation in pork muscle and adipose-tissue during storage. *Journal of*
591 *Agricultural and Food Chemistry*, *43* (5), 1339-1342.
- 592 Pietrasik, Z., & Janz, J. A. M. (2009). Influence of freezing and thawing on the
593 hydration characteristics, quality, and consumer acceptance of whole muscle

594 beef injected with solutions of salt and phosphate. *Meat Science*, 81 (3), 523-
595 532.

596 Priolo, A., Cornu, A., Prache, S., Krogmann, M., Kondjoyan, N., Micol, D., &
597 Berdagué, J. L. (2004). Fat volatiles tracers of grass feeding in sheep. *Meat*
598 *Science*, 66 (2), 475-481.

599 Resano, H., Sanjuan, A. I., Cilla, I., Roncales, P., & Albisu, L. M. (2010). Sensory
600 attributes that drive consumer acceptability of dry-cured ham and convergence
601 with trained sensory data. *Meat Science*, 84 (3), 344-351.

602 Resconi, V. C., Campo, M. M., Furnols, M. F. I., Montossi, F., & Sanudo, C. (2009).
603 Sensory evaluation of castrated lambs finished on different proportions of
604 pasture and concentrate feeding systems. *Meat Science*, 83 (1), 31-37.

605 Resconi, V. C., Campo, M. M., Montossi, F., Ferreira, V., Sañudo, C., & Escudero, A.
606 (2010). Relationship between odour-active compounds and flavour perception in
607 meat from lambs fed different diets. *Meat Science*, 85 (4), 700-706.

608 Sanudo, C., Sanchez, A., & Alfonso, M. (1998). Small ruminant production systems and
609 factors affecting lamb meat quality. *Meat Science*, 49, 29-64.

610 Schieberle, P. (1992). Formation of Furaneol in Heat-Processed Foods. In *Flavor*
611 *Precursors* (Vol. 490, pp. 164-174): American Chemical Society.

612 Smith, G. C., Spaeth, C. W., Carpentre, Z. L., King, G. T., & Hoke, K. E. (1968). Effects
613 of freezing frozen storage conditions and degree of doneness on lamb
614 palatability characteristics. *Journal of Food Science*, 33 (1), 19-&.

615 Spanier, A. M., Flores, M., McMillin, K. W., & Bidner, T. D. (1997). The effect of
616 post-mortem aging on meat flavor quality in Brangus beef. Correlation of
617 treatments, sensory, instrumental and chemical descriptors. *Food Chemistry*, 59
618 (4), 531-538.

619 Sutherland, M. M., & Ames, J. M. (1995). The effect of castration on the headspace
620 aroma components of cooked lamb. *Journal of the Science of Food and*
621 *Agriculture*, 69, 403-413.

622 Tarladgis, B. G., Watts, B. M., Younathan, M. T., & Dugan, L. (1960). A distillation
623 method for the quantitative determination of malonaldehyde in rancid foods.
624 *Journal of the American Oil Chemists Society*, 37 (1), 44-48.

625 Uttaro, B., & Aalhus, J. L. (2007). Effect of thawing rate on distribution of an injected
626 salt and phosphate brine in beef. *Meat Science*, 75 (3), 480-486.

627 Vieira, C., Diaz, M. T., Martinez, B., & Garcia-Cachan, M. D. (2009). Effect of frozen
628 storage conditions (temperature and length of storage) on microbiological and
629 sensory quality of rustic crossbred beef at different states of ageing. *Meat*
630 *Science*, 83 (3), 398-404.

631 Wheeler, T. L., Miller, R. K., Savell, J. W., & Cross, H. R. (1990). Palatability of
632 chilled and frozen beef steaks. *Journal of Food Science*, 55 (2), 301-304.

633 Young, O. A., Berdague, J. L., Viallon, C., RoussetAkrim, S., & Theriez, M. (1997).
634 Fat-borne volatiles and sheepmeat odour. *Meat Science*, 45 (2), 183-200.

635 Young, O. A., Lane, G. A., Priolo, A., & Fraser, K. (2003). Pastoral and species flavour
636 in lambs raised on pasture, lucerne or maize. *Journal of the Science of Food and*
637 *Agriculture*, 83 (2), 93-104.

638 Zapata, J., Mateo-Vivaracho, L., Cacho, J., & Ferreira, V. (2010). Comparison of
639 extraction techniques and mass spectrometric ionization modes in the analysis of
640 wine volatile carbonyls. *Analytica Chimica Acta*, 660 (1-2), 197-205.

641 Zhang, S. X., Farouk, M. M., Young, O. A., Wieliczko, K. J., & Podmore, C. (2005).
642 Functional stability of frozen normal and high pH beef. *Meat Science*, 69 (4),
643 765-772.

644

645

646